

Chapter Title: Lessons from the Experiences of Women of Color Working in Academia  
Chapter Author(s): Yolanda Flores Niemann

Book Title: Presumed Incompetent

Book Subtitle: The Intersections of Race and Class for Women in Academia

Book Editor(s): Gabriella Gutiérrez y Muhs, Yolanda Flores Niemann, Carmen G. González,  
Angela P. Harris

Published by: University Press of Colorado, Utah State University Press. (2012)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctt4cgr3k.40>

---

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at  
<http://about.jstor.org/terms>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).



*University Press of Colorado, Utah State University Press* are collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Presumed Incompetent*

## CHAPTER 30

# LESSONS FROM THE EXPERIENCES OF WOMEN OF COLOR WORKING IN ACADEMIA

Yolanda Flores Niemann

*. . . they [senior colleagues of color] refused to engage in unforgivable silences that would have perpetuated a presumption that the average white male professor's experiences are the same as those of women of color. They exposed for their dean the reality that we—female faculty of color—do not function in a color- and gender-blind profession and that we who are female and colored are never presumed competent.*

Angela Onwuachi-Willig, "Silence of the Lambs"<sup>1</sup>

Women of color face harsh realities in their professional lives as university faculty members. At the same time, even within the walls of these often-pernicious academic environments, women of color can assert their voices, effect change, find allies, and not only survive, but thrive. These are the courageous truths revealed by this book's authors. They tell us that women of color are the canaries in the academic coal mine (Guinier and Torres 2002) and warn us of the toxic nature of academic workplaces for members of historically underrepresented groups. The challenges these authors have faced are grounded largely in the quadruple threat of racism, sexism, homophobia, and class-based subordination. This combination of "isms" can be lethal to their careers, bodies, and spirits in the culture of the predominantly white, male, heterosexual, and upper-middle-/upper-class academy. These authors' firsthand knowledge and observations take place in diverse types of institutions—from private schools to land-grant state universities, Hispanic-serving institutions, and community colleges—and across academic disciplines.

---

<sup>1</sup> All italic quotations in the present chapter are taken from previous chapters in this book.

*The psychological evidence suggests that readers—both women and men—will be inclined to dismiss the events described as exaggerations or illustrations of “oversensitivity.” Others will believe the incidents are real and accurately portrayed but will attribute the problem to rare and unusual “bad actors.” However, the examples the authors describe, which may startle those of us who live a different social existence, typify life for a woman of color in academia.*

John F. Dovidio, “Introduction,” Part II

A summary chapter cannot take the place of the transformative understanding that results from absorbing the emotional content of each of the experiences shared in this volume. These narratives evoke a wide range of emotions and responses—from sadness, frustration, anger, and tears to contentment, validation, and laughter. They plant the seeds of change so that future generations of women of color and members of other historically underrepresented groups may have more fulfilling, respectful, and dignified experiences as faculty in the academic realm. Readers are encouraged to take the time to absorb and truly understand the narratives.

*They [the narratives in this book] expose problems related to being “outsiders” within that reveal the ubiquitous power of numerous dominant ideologies in US society, including white supremacy, patriarchy, heteronormativity, classism, ethnocentrism, and rationality. Their combined narratives illustrate ways that members of the academy routinely and robotically rely on these prevailing belief systems as they indoctrinate one another into specific roles.*

Brenda J. Allen, “Introduction,” Part I

The authors of this collection, and the countless untold stories they represent, deserve a theoretical discussion and analysis of how and why group-based discriminatory practices are still occurring in today’s academic world. They merit and demand a comprehensive theory of the foundations of tokenism and related damaging experiences too often sustained by members of underrepresented groups in these places that are supposed to be bastions of knowledge and enlightenment. A viable theory must include scrutiny of the roles of institutionalized power and privilege and societal mores, history, and values in generating and exacerbating the realities these women have lived. A theory that can serve as a foundation for change must reflect lessons from the extensive social science research on racism, sexism, classism, heterosexism, stereotypes, group dynamics, cognitive distortions, and the role of socioecological forces in individual and group behavior toward members of historically underrepresented groups. In addition, illuminating constructs that have been developed and documented in the field of law—e.g., critical race theory—and other academic disciplines will help formulate such a theory. It is a daunting and complex task but one that I hope talented scholars will be moved to develop and disseminate upon reading this collection. However, that much-needed thesis is not provided in the present concluding chapter. The intent in this chapter is to formulate more immediate, concrete, and applicable recommendations that may help circumvent and/or diffuse the conditions described in this anthology.

The goals of this chapter are fourfold. The first is to help readers understand the ways existing structures create the hostile environments that these women describe. These structures include formal and informal practices, processes, and policies that create barriers against job satisfaction and tenure and promotion. Tenure is the coin of the realm for faculty (Seldin and Miller 2009). Increasingly, however, institutional preferences for contractual faculty (MLA Task Force 2007), coupled with biases against women of color, are contributing to their overrepresentation in adjunct roles (Ryu 2010). This state of affairs is increasing the number of underrepresented group members who are especially vulnerable to inequitable practices and hostile climates.

Existing academic structures facilitate different realities and rules of the game for members of historically underrepresented groups as compared to those of their white, heterosexual colleagues. These disparate realities create shaky ground for women of color and provide evidence that no matter how hard they work, how many degrees they possess, what titles they earn, or what levels and/or positions they acquire, they are still vulnerable to malevolent experiences as faculty members. The more -isms associated with their identities, the more personally directed is the antagonism and the more oppressive is the unchallenged, status-quo environment.

*I now understand how important it is to know your strengths and the way the academic promotion and tenure game is played. Often the formal, unwritten rules are hidden from those who “aren’t a good fit.” This causes African American women and other marginalized groups to stumble and appear incompetent when that is not the case.*

Sherri L. Wallace, Sharon E. Moore, Linda L. Wilson,  
and Brenda G. Hart, “African American Women  
in the Academy: Quelling the Myth of  
Presumed Incompetence”

Existing structures also affect misinformation about federal affirmative action policies, contributing to the stereotypical idea that persons of color enter faculty ranks not because of their high qualifications and competence, but rather due to a policy perceived as “reverse discrimination” against white males (Rai and Critzer 2000). Practices generated by this misinformation produce biased search processes that prevent equal access to members of underrepresented groups. As Derrick Bell (1980) and others postulate, and research demonstrates (Kinder and Sears 1985; Lipsitz 1998; Niemann and Dovidio 1998b), the will of the majority is almost always informed by their self-interest. The academic majority consists of white males, who typically see affirmative action as a zero-sum game that disadvantages them, thereby fueling resentment toward persons of color and, to a lesser extent, toward white females (Lipsitz 1998; Rai and Critzer 2000). In stark contrast to the reverse discrimination argument, however, are the data—white men and white women constitute 45 percent and 32 percent of the full-time faculty, respectively, while US men and women of color combined account for only 17 percent of the total distribution of full-time faculty (African American—5.4 percent, Hispanic—3.6 percent, Asian American—7.6 percent, and American Indian—0.5 percent; these totals include only known race/ethnicity) (Ryu 2010). Foreign nationals constitute 4.4 percent of the total full-time faculty (Ryu 2010).

. . . it is stunning to read the essays in this volume showing the repeated efforts by contemporary white academics, lawyers, and politicians to manipulate statistics and feign liberal intentions while denouncing affirmative action, claiming “reverse discrimination”—as if there even were such a thing—and blaming students of color and women for their presumed “failures.” . . . America’s public discourse on race often remains entrenched in fear, self-delusion, denial, and co-optation, including the presentations, papers, and essays by some very powerful academics and politicians. Some, who even declare themselves liberals or feminists, continue to deny every statistical, sociological, and political study of actual, verifiable discrimination based on race and/or gender. It is truly mind-boggling arrogance and ignorance.

Bettina Aptheker, “Foreword”

*To build diversity and inclusion in our institutions and disciplines . . . we need more than numbers. . . we must create a healthy climate. This requires a culture of collaboration where issues of intersectionality can be addressed. Inclusion requires justice and due process. It also needs the give and take of social support, of flexibility of models and respect for individual and group differences, and, perhaps most daringly, of risk taking where leaders and others are free to make mistakes and change course. . . . We have an opportunity to create a “new normal,” to establish policies and foster practices that will become second nature in the culture of departments and units because they truly expand the possibilities of excellence for everyone.*

Nancy Cantor, “Introduction,” Part III

The second goal of this chapter is to help members of historically underrepresented groups understand that their challenging experiences are grounded in their situation, not in their competencies. For example, women of color experience the psychological and career consequences of tokenism, which is defined as “the policy of making only a perfunctory effort or symbolic gesture toward the accomplishment of a goal, such as racial integration; . . . the practice of hiring or appointing a token number of people from underrepresented groups in order to deflect criticism or comply with affirmative action rules” (*American Heritage Dictionary* 2000, “Tokenism”); “. . . the practice of making only a token effort or doing no more than the minimum, especially in order to comply with a law” (*Collins English Dictionary*, 2003, “Tokenism”). Tokenism is most likely to occur when members of the minority group in any situation account for fewer than 15 percent of the total (Kanter 1977; Niemann 2003; Pollak and Niemann 1998; Yoder 1985). Since women of color represent only 7.5 percent of all full-time faculty (Ryu 2010), they are highly vulnerable to being tokenized with the harmful consequences that are shared in this collection of narratives and explored in this chapter. The recommendations provided to administrators and to women of color and their allies in this chapter address the challenges of tokenization in a predominantly white institution of higher education.

*The strand unifying these articles is the message that we remain wary of tokenism and will not forsake one another as we advance through the academic ranks.*

Deena J. González, "Introduction," Part V

The third goal of the chapter is to provide a road map by which women of color may navigate the difficult terrain chronicled in this volume and gain a sense of belonging. Lacking genuine acceptance from students, colleagues, administrators, and staff, women of color often feel like outsiders in the academic world. They must consider a multitude of perspectives when they determine whether the academy is their right career choice. They reflect on ways they can help pave the road for all students and faculty who follow. They heed their years of preparing for an academic career, including the accumulated fiscal debt resulting from their commitment to earn a PhD. Due in large part to cultural expectations and values, they must also weigh the impact of their decisions on their families.

*Belonging*, then, becomes a complex reality in this context. But serving in predominantly white academic institutions (which describes almost all research universities) often comes at a high price. When women of color gauge their fit, they must also ask, "How much of a price can I afford to pay at this time?" "What are the costs to my physical and psychological health?" And they must walk into these positions with eyes wide open, without naïveté, and with a positive outlook, but also with a realistic understanding of the world they are about to enter. As someone with considerable administrative experience, I can attest that the price that women of color pay may get heavier with increasing visibility, authority, and power within the institution.

*As the individuals asking how universities work are usually successful in their fields and often belong to a variety of private clubs, I point out that—in my opinion—universities have much in common with elite country clubs. The academic credentials are necessary to be invited to join, but like all country clubs, not all members are perceived as equal. The older, usually white males from affluent backgrounds and prestigious universities are traditionally perceived to be the social and academic leaders, as well as the decision makers . . . The perceived social order or structure usually descends from the white males with affluent backgrounds from prestigious universities down through individuals with lesser income or less-impressive degrees. Women of all colors are usually considered below men, and their status diminishes more if they are of color, which indicates they may have come from lower-income families and neighborhoods. The university as a country club has existed for a very long time. It is often unfair and hurtful to those perceived to be of lower status. The narratives in this work speak for themselves, and it took considerable courage for these authors to relate their experiences. Why do I think these authors were courageous in telling of their experiences? Simply stated, universities—like country clubs—do not like to share unfavorable information with those outside their own community.*

Samuel H. Smith, "Introduction," Part IV

Change may be on the horizon as the *zeitgeist* presently surrounding academia may be compelling transformation to this elitist world. US demographics are compelling some state legislatures, regents, and trustees to begin to see their universities through lenses of members of underrepresented groups, even if only out of concern for financial implications of lowered enrollment numbers. Legislative demands increasingly focus on accountability with a greater emphasis on the needs and expectations of the greatest number of consumers. The very existence of tenure is being challenged by some legislative bodies (Arum and Roksa 2011; Bok 2006; Spellings 2006).

Allies of historically underrepresented groups are slowly gaining power to facilitate change. A few white male university leaders and faculty are increasingly taking a public role in advocating and developing opportunities for members of underrepresented groups (e.g., Bowen and Bok 1998; articles by Samuel Smith, John Dovidio, and Dean Spade in this volume). White women with the courage to challenge the status quo, like Syracuse Chancellor Nancy Cantor, who also contributed to this volume, are succeeding in the highest-level university positions. Slowly, a very small number of men and women of color are being appointed president at research universities; Elson Floyd (Washington State University), Ruth Simmons (Brown University), Frances Córdova (Purdue University), and Mildred Garcia (California State University, Dominguez Hills) are recent examples. These persons have broken through barriers into leadership positions dominated by white men, and are slowly, but effectively challenging the elitist culture in the universities they lead. Others will follow. Their leadership may inspire a cultural shift, even as they carefully pace their actions to ensure their own survival in their roles in predominantly white institutions. In particular—as the group that has the most in common with white men—white women have the greatest potential to be allies of women of color and lynchpins of cultural change in the university. However, to do so they must acknowledge and understand the privilege generated by their whiteness and its benefits.

*Was I aware of my privilege as a white woman? I am not sure, but I believe I did not fully consider the racial privilege that bolstered my position. I believe my lack of consciousness did not arise from an exclusionary impulse but from a limited experiential horizon, a lack of consciousness that contributed to a false sense of normalcy . . . I didn't notice anyone missing as I moved from one environment to the next. This, of course, is the essence of privilege.*

Stephanie A. Shields, "Waking Up to Privilege:  
Intersectionality and Opportunity"

*My years in grassroots activism provide an anchor for the values I want to bring to this work, just as the example of radical academics intervening on these issues supplies inspiration.*

Dean Spade, "Notes toward Racial and Gender Justice  
Ally Practice in Legal Academia"

A fourth goal of this chapter is to remind women of color of their resilience and ability to overcome the very challenging realities described in this anthology's

narratives. These essays illuminate some of the various strategies utilized by women faculty of color and their allies to subvert entrenched hierarchies and maintain their physical and psychological health. The recommendations they provide inspire women of color to thrive and to become leaders across rank, position, and role within the academy.

*Regardless of all the things I have discussed and the complicated interactions I may have with my students, I love being a college professor. I see it as a contribution to improving this most incomprehensible society. I also see it as my way of helping leave this place in a better condition than I found it.*

Carmen R. Lugo-Lugo, "A Prostitute, a Servant, and a Customer-Service Representative: A Latina in Academia"

### Outline of Recommendations and Lessons from Narratives

*Changing the culture of any university is similar to changing the direction of a very large ship. It is difficult to do and usually takes a very long time. With our perceptions of decreasing quality and increasing financial stress, we have reached a time in our history where it is not only possible but critical for the future of our nation for us to move away from the country-club atmosphere.*

Samuel H. Smith, "Introduction," Part IV

In this chapter, I provide timely, specific actions that academic leaders may take to effect impending change and develop a climate where all faculty members have opportunities for a successful career in higher education (Bok 2006; Hurtado 2007). The overarching goals of the recommendations that follow are to: (1) provide administrators the tools to effectively facilitate climate and cultural change in their institutions and eliminate and/or diffuse the effects of tokenism; and (2) empower women of color and women from gender and sexual identity minority groups to succeed in these environments while retaining their dignity, integrity, and self-efficacy. Recommendations focus primarily on faculty members who are navigating challenging university climates and the tenure and promotion process. These suggestions are written from my perspective as a heterosexual Mexican American woman who comes from a very humble socioeconomic background, has achieved tenure and the rank of full professor in a research university, and has served in various university administrative roles. Recommendations are guided by the general structure of the book and are organized as follows:

1. General Campus Climate
2. Faculty/Student Relations
3. Social Class, Tokenism, and the Search Process
4. Tenure and Promotion
5. Networks of Allies and Mentors



As indicated in this flowchart, the recommendations overlap and feed into each other.

## General Campus Climate

### *Recommendations for Administrators*

#### 1. Model a culture of respect

Campus climate is created from the top down. Teaching does not only happen in front of the classroom. The campus leadership team models the way to treat all members of the community and must be strongly encouraged to behave accordingly. Persons with the greatest formal power and authority have an ethical obligation and moral responsibility to be particularly sensitive to their treatment of persons with less power.

*His yelling at me in a mailroom that at the time was full of white faculty and students felt as if my fate had been sealed—I wasn't as smart as everyone else. I couldn't cut it, and now it seemed everyone knew it. My face began to get hot, tears began to form, and I watched the white faculty and staff make a hasty exit from the mailroom so they did not have to witness any more of my humiliation.*

Serena Easton, "On Being Special"

#### 2. Be color conscious, not color-blind

From the time that faculty of color are recruited, publicly convey your understanding that they bring added value to the university community through their diverse perspectives in addition to their disciplinary expertise and scholarly accomplishments and potential. In a meaningful way, reward faculty of color for their engagement with the community of color within and surrounding the university. Color blindness is a façade. Adherence to color blindness as an expected outcome or goal is not only unrealistic; it denies the experiential realities of people of color and stymies productive discussions about how persons can genuinely get to know one another across racial/ethnic/national group identities.

*Society purports to prize color blindness, and that goal makes it hard to see race in public spaces. Race is the elephant in the room that everyone tiptoes around . . . Whites may fear that talking about race makes them seem racist. It would be more helpful for everyone to notice when race and racism are actually present and think about how to combat the problem. Society cannot battle a phantom that it cannot recognize and name. Whites ignore race at their peril and risk causing unintended harm to colleagues of color as the dynamics of racism grind on their daily lives.*

Margalynne J. Armstrong and Stephanie M. Wildman,  
"Working across Racial Lines in a  
Not-So-Postracial World"

. . . *She observes that most white women are extremely uncomfortable distinguishing between the realities of their lives and those of women of color. White women become angry when they use the word “woman,” and she interjects, “You mean white women.”*

Stephanie A. Shields, “Waking Up to Privilege: Intersectionality and Opportunity”

3. Model your value of campus diversity by including members of underrepresented groups in your leadership team and engage your team in color insight groups

Be sure that some of the persons of color across gender and sexual identities on your team have line authority and power and are not just in associate or assistant positions. Engage your leadership team in color-insight discussions to model healthy and productive attitudes and discussions about race/ethnicity, stereotypes, and biases. To admit these prejudices, however, can arouse defense mechanisms that protect one’s sense of self, making honest conversations on this topic very difficult. These discussions, therefore, require facilitation by persons skilled and trained in diversity matters. The first step toward changing group perception is acknowledgment of biases. Toward that end, advise your leadership team to take the Implicit Association Test, which confidentially helps participants discover what stereotypes they hold about different groups. The test may be found at <https://implicit.harvard.edu/implicit/demo/s>.

*Color insight . . . contrasts with color blindness and offers an alternative that meets the purported goals of color blindness, racial equality, and justice. Color insight recognizes that a racial status quo exists where society attributes race to each member. While color blindness urges us not to notice, color insight says, “Don’t be afraid—notice your race and the race of others around you and learn about what that means.”*

Margalynne J. Armstrong and Stephanie M. Wildman,  
“Working across Racial Lines in a Not-So-Postracial World”

4. Incorporate a dean of the faculty into your university administrative structure

Through a dual reporting structure to both the university president and provost, empower the dean of the faculty to have oversight of faculty-specific equity, equality, recruitment, and retention issues. This position is important because faculty do not typically have a trusted person or advocate in a position of authority outside of persons who are in their supervisory chain of command. Diversity offices typically do not have power over academic affairs. Faculty must often file an official complaint to receive intervention from offices of human resources or affirmative action/equal opportunity. As such, faculty are usually left on their own to face challenging and institutionalized matters that impact their success and job satisfaction, e.g., unequal salary between men and women in a given unit, and inequitable work distribution. The dean of the faculty can also address issues of recruitment and retention of members of historically underrepresented groups, and do so with the power and

authority of an academic dean. As such, the dean of the faculty can be a critical link for faculty success, faculty morale, and for positively impacting climate and cultural change in the institution.

*The cumulative effects, the destructive power of unaltered structures, of traditional bases of privilege and identity, eroded the confidence many [women of color] had at the beginning of their careers to be able to reach students, who in turn could indeed embody better ways of thinking or change the world as we knew it through practice. . . . From the struggles to make institutions more humane or responsive to basic and expanding human needs, the lessons accumulate. We are richer for hearing these lessons told in the words of those who have seen, heard, and spoken “truth to power.”*

Deena J. González, “Introduction,” Part V

5. Develop an action- and outcome-based diversity plan that focuses on the most underrepresented group members of your campus

Develop a well-documented, very-public statement of the university’s goals for a climate of inclusion and mutual respect for all persons. Establish a campus representative task force to develop a strategic plan to meet these goals. To be taken seriously, the committee must be outcome- and action-oriented and have financial and personnel resources to accomplish goals. The committee should have dual reporting lines to the president and provost, and/or dean of the faculty, indicating top-down support. Committee members should include the most senior, productive, and powerful faculty on campus, representing faculty campus leadership that will influence the attitudes of their colleagues. It should also include sub-groups of student and community members that report to the committee, reflecting grass roots and town-gown support for the initiative. If you make this matter the sole purview of select units, such as offices of diversity or equal opportunity, you will be sending the wrong message and will symbolically—if not actually—marginalize this important initiative.

*It has been my experience that my treatment as a woman of color, working as an army civilian, is a nonissue because those of us who work for the army benefit from advances that the government has made in workforce diversity and establishing an environment where rank, command experience, and the ability to complete a mission are what is respected and valued, regardless of your ethnicity.*

Kelly Ervin, “The Experiences of an Academic ‘Misfit’”

6. Issues related to discrimination and prejudice can change the tenor and interpretation of a discussion and/or situation

Perceptions of what happened and ways to interpret behavior may vary dramatically when a situation becomes charged with anxiety about race, gender, and/or gender and sexual identity (Sue 2010). Remember that we see what we expect to see (Fiske and Taylor 1984). You may be surprised by the degree to which seemingly small issues can be blown out of proportion when race, gender, and gender and sexual identity are involved. Ordinarily calm and trustworthy colleagues can

suddenly turn irrational when their unconsciously held expectations and stereotypes about others are openly challenged. Fair-minded people often do not want to acknowledge the -isms of their community members and colleagues.

You may not understand how a colleague who treats you with respect can treat others so abominably. You may be blind to discrimination if you deny the existence of aversive, covert/subtle, and overt racism. But women of color do not have the option of not seeing racism and sexism. They are targets of the -isms and experience them in their professional lives in the academy. Sexist attitudes are also a reality in the academy, in some disciplines more than in others. If men of color have been accepted into the department, do not assume that women of color will be accepted as well. Remember, also, that racism and sexism are not only a matter of intentions. Even if you believe a colleague genuinely said or did something without any malevolent intent, if others perceived the comment or action as racist or sexist, harm has been done, and you should act accordingly and appropriately in the interest of all parties concerned, especially those with the least formal power and authority.

*. . . it's okay to sort of have a warrior aspect to your personality, but when you're in an institution which only supports that one aspect of ourselves, the person is in trouble. And it will start showing up in health, which it did for me. I started getting some very serious symptoms from stress.*

Michelle M. Jacob, "Native Women Maintaining Their Culture in the White Academy"

7. Do not let people get away with vague, unsubstantiated accusations

Be an active, careful listener when members of historically underrepresented groups are accused of misconduct. Insist on verifying accounts of their alleged behavior. It is especially critical that you hear the perspective of the victim of the accusations when that person is a member of an underrepresented group. As a result of racist and sexist agendas, people are sometimes willing to perpetrate and believe outright lies and distortions about people of color in their workplace. To the best of your ability, ascertain the veracity of allegations. People will learn to stop irresponsibly complaining about faculty from historically underrepresented groups if you ask detailed questions and insist on evidence. It is critical that you ask the persons of colors being accused how they recall the event. If accusers do not want to confront the person of color, why not? Understand that white anger about anything—low wages, changes in rigor or expectations—often results in lashing out at people of color, especially women.

When a woman of color makes an accusation, the same rules apply. Understand that her attributional ambiguity (Crocker et al. 1991), or not knowing whether or not behavior toward her is grounded in bias, may lead her to interpret acts as racist, sexist, or homophobic. At the same time, it may be difficult for her to describe how she knows that someone is biased. Many clues about how people perceive us are unconsciously understood after years of experience interacting with members of the dominant group, e.g., eye movement and other body language, patronization, and general discomfort. For people of color, knowledge of people's biases often becomes instinctive.

*I feel an incredible sense of emptiness in the middle of my body. I pick up the phone to call my oldest friend in California and then put it down. Instead, I grab a pillow and put it over my stomach and begin to cry my guts out. I am crying because less than an hour before I had walked out of the dean's office after a bizarre meeting with him and a few members of the promotion and tenure committee, who had tried to talk me out of proceeding with my application for tenure. . . . And like the victim of abuse who dissociates from her body to survive trauma, I remember the implosion, the fading of their voices, and the awkward posture of everyone on the dean's leather couch as they executed their act of rejection. And before too much more could be said, I barely uttered, "I don't have to listen to this . . .," and I walked out. And the next day I met with a lawyer.*

Elvia R. Arriola, "No hay mal que por bien no venga": A Journey to Healing as a Latina, Lesbian Law Professor"

#### 8. Understand why people are leaving the university

Conduct exit interviews of faculty; analyze the data for patterns, correlations, and causality; take action accordingly. The interviews should be conducted by persons in human resources, or other appropriate units, who may be trusted with confidential information. Identifying information should be removed from the interview before the data are passed along for analyses.

*Standing there with more than ten years of exemplary performance appraisals and . . . superior teaching evaluations, I was devastated and felt violated! More importantly, others would presume my transfer was due to incompetence. The mounting anxieties from ostracism, isolation, stress, and the loss of professional support and interaction made me feel like a pariah. . . . I felt the situation was literally eating me alive and I was totally alone . . . . I did receive support from former students, who refused to accept my replacement and actively sought me out.*

Sherri L. Wallace, Sharon E. Moore, Linda J. Wilson,  
and Brenda G. Hart, "African American Women  
in the Academy: Quelling the Myth  
of Presumed Incompetence"

#### 9. Develop an "equity scorecard" to determine how faculty members fare by gender and race/ethnicity by department and college

This "scorecard" (Bensimon, Hao, and Bustillos 2006; Bensimon 2005) should include data on retention, tenure and promotion across ranks, numbers of courses and students taught, and documentation of service responsibilities. Your institutional research office can readily collect and analyze these data. You want information to determine if race/ethnicity and/or gender impact faculty success within a given unit.

*I began to realize that their stories [those of white colleagues] sounded very different from mine. In my sections, everything I said was questioned, scrutinized, and cross-examined. Fully expecting my compatriots to complain about the same problems, I was stunned when they began looking at*

*me as if I had just grown an eyeball on my forehead. They weren't having these difficulties in their sections—it was just me . . . Only I was forced to pull up statistics, photos, theories, graphs, and charts constantly as evidence that what I was saying was true. I would bear witness to their privilege over and over again, only reinforcing my loneliness in that six-year period and reinforcing my race as a master status in a way it hadn't been before. For most of my life, race was there and was a reality but not one that necessarily confronted me every day.*

Serena Easton, "On Being Special"

10. Examine salaries by rank, race/ethnicity, and gender to ensure equity within departments and disciplines

Salaries may be inequitable because women often lack the mentoring to know how to negotiate their initial salaries and increases. But they may also be inequitable due to racism and sexism. Higher salaries for men than for women may reflect the sexist biases of the appointing supervisor and the value they place on appointees. The biases must be challenged up the supervisory chain, and the inequitable salaries must be corrected.

*When I asked how they knew to negotiate that way, they credited advice passed to them by fathers with professional careers or male mentors. I learned that womyn of color needed to be diligent about seeking and providing mentorship for each other.*

Michelle A. Holling, May Fu, and Roe Bubar, "Dis/  
Jointed Appointments: Solidarity amidst Inequality,  
Tokenism, and Marginalization"

11. Use resources as a carrot to shape campus diversity and climate

The most powerful accountability measure you have is allocation of resources. Make the bases of college, unit, department resources, evaluations, and faculty salary increases, in part, dependent on their successes with increasing diversity and enhancing collegiality, mentorship, and retention in their units.

*. . . when you are fighting for your life within a context of inequality, you can become so busy trying to survive that you have no time to reflect on the system that is putting you in that position in the first place. I was in the trenches of the academic jungle, taking grenades. When you are fighting a war like that, you don't have time to think about the structure of the war, whether or not it should be happening in the first place, or what has put you in the midst of it. No matter how much you may know in your head that you and your people are victims of a system that you didn't create, it doesn't really matter when you're taking grenades. You must react to stay alive.*

Serena Easton, "On Being Special"

## 12. Language matters

Do not use the word “tolerance,” which implies a forced attitude. People of color want to be accepted, respected, and valued for who we are, not tolerated. The phrase “members of historically underrepresented groups” is now more commonly accepted than the word “minorities.” Use group-specific terms, e.g., African American/black; Latino/Latina (but use the actual group identifier when known, e.g., Mexican American, Puerto Rican); Asian American (again, use specific group names when known, e.g., Vietnamese American, Japanese American); American Indian or Native American. Use the description “persons across gender and sexual identities” for members of non-heterosexual groups.

*Or they'll tell you about how their momma and poppa and uncle and everyone else in their family hates niggers, but they don't—that's a quote.*

Sherée Wilson, “They Forgot Mammy Had a Brain”

## 13. Do Not Define white Women as the De Facto Norm for All Women by Using the Phrase “Women and People of Color” or “Women and Minorities”

Women of color are women; they are also people of color; they are also minorities. The use of the phrases “women and people of color” and “women and minorities” makes women of color invisible while defining white women as the de facto norm. The use of these phrases minimizes the intersectional realities that both link and separate white women, men of color, and women of color and that the essays in this collection reflect.

*. . . third-wave feminism steers clear of essentialist notions of femininity to embrace the experiences of all women, rather than only those of a particular race and class. . . .*

Kimberly R. Moffitt, Heather E. Harris, and Diane A. Forbes Berthoud, “Present and Unequal: A Third-Wave Approach to Voice Parallel Experiences in Managing Oppressions and Bias in the Academy”

*Probably the most blatant example of blindness to white privilege was lurking at the heart of my own research. . . . Unthinkingly I began the way that most gender-stereotype researchers did—by using descriptions of a generic woman and generic man to explore the stereotypes. And—as research has shown time and time again—generic in the US academic world signals white . . . Interestingly none of the probably all-white audience of editors, conference attendees, or other colleagues who assessed my work stopped to ask “which woman? which man?”*

Stephanie A. Shields, “Waking Up to Privilege: Intersectionality and Opportunity”

## 14. Learn how to supervise women of color

Supervising women of color is a new experience for most white men and women in academia, as well as for most men and women of color. Supervisors may not be

aware that—although they are looking at a woman of color—they *often do not really see her*. They see what they expect to see, and often that expectation is based on racist, sexist, homophobic, and classist ideology (Jones 1997; Allport 1954). When persons do not fit a group stereotype, they often arouse anxiety and anger in the perceiver (Fiske and Taylor 1984). This response is true especially when the person is exceptionally competent, which arouses conscious and unconscious biases and resentments regarding who deserves to have power over whom (Dovidio and Gaertner 2010). In addition, stereotypical expectations often lead supervisors to assign women of color to teaching and service related to diversity issues, responsibilities for which they may not have been trained nor have vested interest.

. . . (a) no matter how we frame our research agenda, prospective employers think our work will be connected to African American women; (b) we are eager to nurture and mentor other students of color, regardless of their majors or career interests; (c) we will incorporate race and gender into the courses we teach (despite the fact that many of us have no coursework on our transcripts related to these issues); (d) we will enthusiastically serve on any committee with the word “diversity” in the title; and (e) we are well equipped to “deal with” students from underprivileged backgrounds who are not as well prepared for college as they should be.

Cerise L. Glenn, “Stepping in and Stepping out:  
Examining the Way Anticipatory Career Socialization  
Impacts Identity Negotiation of African American  
Women in Academia”

#### 15. Avoid knee-jerk reactions to accusations of racism

Inevitably, a student, faculty member, or administrator will accuse someone in your university community of engaging in racist, sexist, or homophobic behavior. It is very important to be proactive, rather than reactive. Be prepared with processes in place that thoughtfully investigate the claim, and then publicly report the findings, thereby identifying unfounded claims as well as verified incidents. Ensure that complaints provide as much specific information about persons, times, and places as possible. Be clear that unfounded accusations of racism, sexism, and anti-homosexual behavior, if not clearly refuted, weaken the response to the actual experiences of discrimination on your campus. Have the courage to stand your ground when the accusation is clearly false but also be aware that it can be difficult for a grievant to prove that an action was grounded on bias. Use the entire context of the situation, including the culture and demographic makeup of your campus and community, to inform your judgment.

*So seeing race for whites must mean noticing whiteness, not just noticing race when a person of color is present. . . . It is not that whiteness simply privileges white people. Whiteness can also negate people of color, who are judged by their conformance to white norms, disparaged by their perceived dependence on whiteness, or silenced by invisible presumptions of non-white deviance.*

Margalynne J. Armstrong and Stephanie M. Wildman,  
“Working across Racial Lines in a  
Not-So-Postracial World”



## 16. If you celebrate Martin Luther King Jr. Day, make it meaningful

This celebration is at once an experience of pride for African Americans and a time that many dread. Most women and men of color dislike being asked to engage in ethnic celebrations that lack any real meaning or significance, and are implemented for the university's ability to engage in an empty public-relations gesture. Do not use these occasions to put people of color on display or tokenize them. Rather, ask for volunteers to participate in the events of the day. Plan activities that involve all university constituents. For instance, Martin Luther King Jr. Day celebrations might be a time to award service-related achievements to the university community-at-large. Solicit awards and nominations from different sectors of the university community, including tenure-track faculty, lecturers, students, fraternities, sororities, staff, and student affairs, research, and development departments. The more inclusive the events of the day, the more meaningful the commemoration of the work of Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr.

*They are going to trot you out and trot you around as their African American person, but that's not considered in terms of your workload. It doesn't count. They are going to expect you to mentor and take care of students of color, but you're not going to get credit for that, either. I learned a lot. They wanted our visibility in the service arena, but they didn't want to reward you for it. . . . It was almost like the mammy syndrome.*

Sherée Wilson, "They Forgot Mammy Had a Brain"

## 17. Provide a parent-friendly environment

Lactation rooms are absolutely critical for women who do not have a private office, e.g., students, lecturers, adjuncts. Provide day care as much as possible; infant care is especially challenging for working parents. Offer nonpunitive leaves of absence for pregnancy and/or new parents. The climate in the university should support all prospective new parents in stopping their tenure clock for a designated period of time.

*. . . when I organized a campus-wide workshop on family-friendly policies targeted to educate junior faculty on their options . . . , few people attended. I learned that some were afraid to attend: they did not want their colleagues to know they were planning to have children, instead of focusing on their publications.*

Linda Trinh Võ, "Navigating the Academic Terrain: The Racial and Gender Politics of Elusive Belonging"

*I just wish people were more candid about the fact that the professoriate is not particularly well suited for parents after all. There is a lot of hostility toward parents from both men and women without kids in this discipline, really harsh.*

Jessica Lavariega Monforti, "La Lucha: Latinas Surviving Political Science"

18. Mandate meaningful sexual-harassment-prevention training and address complaints immediately

An expert in the area of sexual harassment prevention and consequences should oversee this training. Have policies in place to address sexual harassment and, through policy, mandate consequences to faculty who have sexual contact with students and /or with employees they supervise. Understand that some persons stereotype women of color as sexually exotic, docile, permissive, and available to them. Social-class issues may also become important in these situations because the culturally based friendliness and generosity of women of color, especially from lower socioeconomic backgrounds, may be misinterpreted as willingness or availability (Dews and Law 1995). Provide good training to help all members of the campus community understand what constitutes sexual harassment and other inappropriate behavior with sexual undertones. Complaints in this domain must be addressed immediately. The victims of these situations may be in both psychological and physical danger, and the perpetrators are often people who have formal authority and power over their victims. It is also likely that if perpetrators get away with victimizing one person, they will continue to perpetrate against others.

*I have had male graduate students and faculty make inappropriate sexual statements and advances toward me, and I know I am not alone. . . . Ideally we should not have to worry about being harassed in the workplace by our colleagues or forced to take action, but the reality is that gender and sexual harassment in both mild and severe forms occurs much more often than is officially reported. . . . it is not the sexual orientation or gender that matters as much as the power relationship: those who are harassed usually have less power in these situations. . . . The preponderance of sexualized and racialized stereotypes about Asian Americans and other women of color can make us vulnerable targets. The converging perceptions of Asian American women as exotic and docile "model minorities," who are less likely to file a complaint, increases the chances of us becoming victims of "racialized sexual harassment."*

Linda Trinh Võ, "Navigating the Academic Terrain: The Racial and Gender Politics of Elusive Belonging"

*Magazine covers are full of phrases like "sizzling hot" and "hot tamales" or the word "sexy" when describing Latinos/as.*

Carmen R. Lugo-Lugo, "A Prostitute, a Servant, and a Customer-Service Representative: A Latina in Academia"

19. National and state leaders can effect change

Changes in the status quo for women of color advocated by this collection of narratives can be facilitated by Congress, the US Secretary of Education, governors, and/or state legislatures through allocation of grant money, which is critical to most universities. Require that institutions provide evidence of real equity and equality in treatment of all their students, faculty, and staff to be qualified to obtain grants and other resources.

20. Boards of trustees, boards of regents, and chancellors can effect change

One way to facilitate change is to hire university leaders with a demonstrated knowledge of underrepresented communities and a commitment to enhancing the diversity of institutions. Currently, relatively few administrators of color serve in academia. In 2003, only 10.39 percent of administrators, including those with academic and student-affairs appointments, were people of color (McCurtis, Jackson, and O'Callaghan 2009). Charge university presidents with creating a respectful cultural climate for all constituents and proving they have done so by recruiting and retaining members of underrepresented groups.

### *Recommendations for Women of Color and Allies*

1. Model appropriate behavior for students and colleagues

By virtue of your position and accomplishments, you are a role model whether or not you want to be seen as such. Students, faculty, staff, administrators, and community members learn from your behavior and attitudes, for better or worse.

2. Know how merit and qualifications are defined

When you serve on student-admission, faculty, or administrator search committees, ensure that the group is looking beyond candidate test scores and schools where degrees were received. Do your best to steer the discussion away from pedigree or elitist backgrounds. Speak up when people are judged negatively on the basis of perceived lower-social-class background. When you have the opportunity, make extra efforts to include people of color across gender and sexual identities on your own staff and/or research teams.

3. When meeting with administrators, present specific solutions to your concerns

Due to their personal ethics and values, and in the interest of the university's reputation, most leaders genuinely want to do the right thing by all members of their academic community. However, they often lack the experience and expertise to develop solutions to your concerns. So let them know what you are experiencing, but go to them with a recommendation or solution. When possible, go to the president's office as part of a collective; it is more time-effective for the president and more powerful for you. Focus on change, on solutions, rather than critiquing what is wrong. University administrators cannot change people's attitudes, but they can model diversity-related values and address issues through policy, code, and process.

4. Document events and interactions that make you uncomfortable; you may have to provide evidence later

Keeping a journal is useful for healing and stress relief, as well as providing evidence that may be needed at a later time. Your detailed journaling will bolster your memory when you complain about an experience or observation. Journal about disrespectful treatment and misinterpretation of statements or actions, especially if you are accused of behavior that may impact your evaluations. Document all agreements regarding assignments and rewards. Also journal about positive experiences;

these will lift your spirits. Do not use nonconfidential venues such as e-mail or Facebook for your journaling.

5. If you are asked to participate in Martin Luther King Jr. Day celebrations, make sure the event is meaningful to you

Be prepared to respond to requests to be a visible participant in Martin Luther King, Jr. commemoration events. If the event is superficial, politely decline. Some faculty of color make a point of being out of town on this day to ensure they have a legitimate excuse not to participate in events they believe are a deceptive depiction of university attitudes. Understand that you have a right not to engage in meaningless gestures, but be wary of repercussions of saying no to administrative requests to participate. You need to determine the best way to handle these situations in your academic environment.

6. Follow the process

Bring to the attention of administrators any failure to follow due process with respect to your evaluations, tenure, and promotion process. At the same time, do not expect or ask to be the exception to the rule. Follow protocol and move through the chain of command—department chair, dean, provost, and president—progressing through the hierarchy only when a previous level fails to address the matter. Diversity officers typically do not have the authority, funding, or power to address faculty matters, so stay within the academic chain of command. A dean of the faculty can be a good resource for you. You may also need to report your experience to the human-resources division of the university; action from these units may require that you file a formal complaint.

7. Practice color consciousness

Help your supervisors understand the distinction between color blindness and color consciousness. Practice color consciousness. Do not try to be a “white woman of color.” That is, do not attempt to be just like the majority but with a different skin tone; you will not succeed. Use your difference to your advantage. Your uniqueness allows you to see what others cannot because they are surrounded by realities similar to their own. Your level of consciousness is different from that of the homogenous majority. You are at once an outsider with the experiences of being on the inside. This complex and broader perception can make you an excellent leader.

8. Do not use the phrases “women and people of color” or “women and minorities”

When you hear others use these phrases, rephrase by saying, “You mean white women and men and women of color” or “white women, women of color, and men of color.” Point out that the realities of women of color are distinct from those of white women and men of color.

9. Report Any Instances of Sexual Harassment Immediately

If people make inappropriate statements and/or advances toward you, report them. If someone misinterprets your friendliness or generosity as a sexual invitation, immediately correct them. Tell them that in your culture, warmth, friendliness, and sharing are normal and have no bearing whatsoever on more intimate relationships

or your professional skills. If harassment persists, file a formal complaint. It is likely that you are not the perpetrator's only victim. Keep doors open when meeting with persons whom you suspect may behave inappropriately toward you. When possible, meet in public places, e.g., the student commons, library, university café.

10. Reflect on whether academia is the right place for your professional contributions

Determining whether to enter into or remain in academia requires reflective analysis of the gains and losses—to your mind, body, family, finances, and your impact on your discipline, institution, and students. Those in administrative positions, in particular, must also take time to heal from wounds that multiply, one upon the other, taking a tremendous physical and psychological toll on their bodies and minds. Not taking the time to heal risks paying the ultimate and inconceivable price—losing your life and/or mental health. Not taking the time to heal also risks internalizing oppressive behaviors and then becoming the oppressor.

## Faculty/Student Relations

### *Recommendations for Administrators*

1. Students carry overt and covert racist attitudes and biases (Stanley 2006).

We are not living in a postracial society. We are all products of our socialization in what is still a racially segregated country and where the majority of the national, state, and corporate leaders are white men. All persons, including university students, have overt biases and stereotypical attitudes, as well as unconscious ones. In addition, foreign students bring with them racial, religious, sexual-orientation, and patriarchal biases from their respective cultures. Remember that these prejudices impact the way students perceive, respond to, and evaluate women of color faculty.

*I contend that the white student's revulsion toward me was transformed into my so-called hatred of "them."*

Delia D. Douglas, "Black/Out: The White Face of Multiculturalism and the Violence of the Canadian Academic Imperial Agenda"

2. When women of color teach topics related to social justice—especially about racially and sexually underrepresented groups in the US—Some, if not most, white students will meet their message with resentment

*So when I actually tell them . . . that racism and racial inequalities are alive and well, their understanding of the world where they live is threatened. By me. A woman. Of color.*

Carmen R. Lugo-Lugo, "A Prostitute, a Servant, and a Customer-Service Representative: A Latina in Academia"

Until they reach the university, many students have not received an accurate account of the histories of historically underrepresented groups in the United States. When they hear this information for the first time, they react with surprise, anger, and/or resentment. Some of these feelings arise from the white guilt persons feel upon learning of atrocities committed against persons of color in the United States. Women of color may be the first professors—even first persons—to challenge students' preexisting ideas about race, sexuality, social class, and the role of the United States government in creating and supporting group-based hierarchies and discriminatory practices. Readings and discussions that confront these assumptions may evoke cognitive dissonance, resulting in anxiety and/or anger. Additionally, the very fact that a woman of color is standing in front of the class and exercising authority may cause students discomfort and resentment. When information about group-based discrimination is provided by women of color and/or persons from underrepresented gender and sexual identities, these feelings intensify. If a white, heterosexual male teaches the material, his privileged positionality in the United States makes it more likely that his teaching will be accepted as factual. When a woman of color presents the same material she may be perceived as acting like a victim or having a chip on her shoulder (Vargas 2002). Complaints about women of color's teaching must be considered in this context.

*White senior faculty members have said that because I am Latina I cannot be credible teaching Latino politics.*

Jessica Lavariega Monforti, "La Lucha: Latinas Surviving Political Science"

3. Keep in mind that students' teaching evaluations may reflect their biases more than the competencies of their instructor

Women of color can be very vulnerable to students' verbal violence toward them, including constant and unwarranted criticism of their teaching. Students harbor stereotyped expectations of women of color. They may be less accepting of poor grades from a person of color, especially a woman, than from a white professor. They may not be aware of what are often unconscious biases about which groups are superior and deserve authority over others. Because students may not be equipped to handle their anxiety, discomfort, and resentment—conscious and unconscious—they may discharge their feelings in generalized complaints about and unjust teaching evaluations of women of color. The latter are frequently bimodal, reflecting both intensely positive and negative comments. As with the investigation of campus and workplace conflicts, administrators must gather specifics, rather than rely on generalized criticism. Candidly discuss different interpretations of these evaluations at departmental and college levels.

*If student evaluations are subjective, are they then also subjective about the race and gender of the instructor? To what extent will a student's reaction to a professor's gender and race influence his or her evaluation? . . . Whites and men start from a presumption of competence; minorities and women do not and have to deal with a multitude of unconscious biases that put them at a disadvantage. The playing field is not level . . . If decision*

*makers do not take the time or care to fully understand the candidate's teaching file, including evaluations, and permit important personnel decisions to proceed on the basis of potentially misleading or biased data, then they ethically fail the professoriate, students, and the institution.*

Sylvia R. Lazos, "Are Student Teaching Evaluations Holding Back Women and Minorities?: The Perils of 'Doing' Gender and Race in the Classroom"

4. Use teaching portfolios to evaluate faculty, rather than relying solely on end-of-course teaching evaluations

Evaluating teaching effectiveness solely on the bases of subjective end-of-course student evaluations is a mistake. This practice is often unfair and harmful to women of color and members of underrepresented gender and sexual-identity groups. Help faculty develop well-prepared teaching portfolios that include a comprehensive understanding of each individual's engagement in the teaching process, broadly defined (e.g., including student advising, consulting with the community) as well as information related to student learning outcomes (Seldin 2004, 2009).

*I began to become increasingly more concerned about consciously performing to maintain my acceptably high student evaluations and what the cost might be to my self-esteem and fulfilling my responsibilities as a teacher. Aside from the time and effort involved, I found myself concentrating more on earning high evaluations and less on the pedagogical goals of my courses.*

Marie-Antoinette Smith, "Free at Last! No More Performance Anxieties in the Academy 'Cause Stepin Fetchit Has Left the Building"

5. Lesbian, bisexual, transgender, and transsexual women of color are particularly vulnerable to student violence and harassment

Women of color who are also members of underrepresented gender and sexual-identity groups are particularly vulnerable to being challenged, getting hate mail, and receiving negative evaluations. This situation may be most pervasive in more conservative areas of the country. Have processes and practices in place to protect faculty from racist, sexist, and homophobic actions of students and peers. Develop support mechanisms for these faculty members.

*. . . although I was bolstered by a number of social and institutional factors—including having a position of authority as a faculty member and a reputation for being nice, fair, and attractive (all shaped by gender, race, and class ideologies), and being white with a PhD—this would not spare me from classroom "microaggression" or interactional cruelties inflicted across lines of difference to maintain racist, classist, sexist, heterosexist, and other oppressive social hierarchies. . . . Midway through the term, someone in the class anonymously posted on our online discussion board an article about the so-called gay agenda that referred to gay people as less than human and responsible for the demise of western civilization. Shortly*

*thereafter another online post specifically named me as a “feminazi.” The note was accompanied by an image of a swastika dripping with blood, framed by a pink triangle, and signed by Fred Phelps (the leader of the God Hates Fags movement).*

Kari Lerum, “‘What’s Love Got to Do with It?’: Life Teachings from Multiracial Feminism”

6. Male students may be especially likely to challenge the authority of women of color

Patriarchal attitudes, grounded in cultural, religious, and historical norms, make some males resentful that women have power and authority over them. These challenges are heightened when students do not receive the grade they want or think they have earned, or when their special requests, e.g., to take an exam on a different date and time, are not accommodated. These students sometimes react with overt hostility when they do not get their way with women of color faculty. Their biases do not allow them to accept that these faculty members should have any authority or power over them. When students come to you with complaints about women of color faculty members, buttress their authority. Be clear that you have complete confidence in her intelligence, competence, and authority. Do not promise to fix the problem for the student; that action sends the message that the faculty member is in error. Develop a process to address students’ disrespect for faculty in the classroom. Let students know what you expect of their behavior in the classroom and the kind of learning campus climate you are attempting to create, e.g., through university mission and/or value statements, and in your oral and written communications. Let faculty know their options. Address and challenge—through public institutional values—the consumer mentality that allows students to believe that by virtue of paying tuition, they control the professor and the curriculum. Your institution’s professional development staff may be able to assist you with this process.

*White students in particular feel entitled to be discourteous, arrogant, and abrasive. They feel very comfortable lashing out. There have been many days when I feel incompetent, disconsolate, and enraged, and in those moments, I simply want to give up.*

Delia D. Douglas, “Black/Out: The White Face of Multiculturalism and the Violence of the Canadian Academic Imperial Agenda”

7. Attitudes about affirmative impact behavior toward women of color

Students, faculty, administrators, and staff often assume that women of color were hired due to affirmative action requirements and not because of their competencies (Rai and Critzer 2000). This assumption is often coupled with the belief that qualified white men are not being hired due to affirmative action policy (Niemann and Dovidio 1998; 2005; Rai and Critzer 2000). As indicated earlier, the data belie these attitudes and beliefs. Nevertheless, attitudes about affirmative action manifest in overt and in subtle and sometimes unconscious judgments, such as the presumption of incompetence. This bias is exacerbated when women of color teach issues



related to social justice to predominantly white classes of students. Take these biases into consideration when you interpret end-of-course evaluations and complaints against faculty. Make public the demographic make-up of the faculty and point to the data that clearly indicates that affirmative action policies are not keeping white males from being hired and promoted to the highest levels of the institution, especially relative to white women and men and women of color.

*Given the white student's racial pronouncement, the director's failure to consider the complexities involved when a black woman teaches a course that focuses on race and its connection to gender and power indicates a lack of awareness (or denial?) of white resentment and resistance, as well as this student's categorization of me as the racial other.*

Delia D. Douglas, "Black/Out: The White Face of Multiculturalism and the Violence of the Canadian Academic Imperial Agenda"

8. Due to perceptions of socioeconomic status, students of color may not support women of color faculty

Due to internalized racial stereotypes, students of color from low socioeconomic status backgrounds often believe that faculty of color must have grown up in upper socioeconomic status backgrounds. They may resent these perceived differences between themselves and the faculty of color (Niemann, et al. 1994). In addition, they may expect these faculty members to be lenient in grading them. Students from highly patriarchal and hierarchical communities and cultures may be particularly resentful of women of color in positions of authority who may hold different values and/or will not lower their academic expectations. Do not assume that a complaint about a woman of color is legitimate because it comes from a student of color.

*These standards included things like writing using proper grammar, spelling, and paragraph structure. . . . And so, inevitably, what my black students saw was a young black girl who talked like a white girl, had been given privileges that they could only dream about, and thus thought she was better than her students, even though that couldn't be further from the truth. Essentially the intersections of race, class, and age conspired to make my life rather difficult at my first job.*

Serena Easton, "On Being Special"

9. Students and faculty may have adverse reactions toward women of color who are not perceived as adequately nurturing

Faculty, staff, and students may have particularly adverse reactions—conscious and unconscious—toward women of color who are not perceived as adequately nurturing or feminine. The stereotype of the mammy and the motherly Latina are particularly strong. Women who do not meet stereotypical expectations that they will nurture students arouse anger, distrust, and feelings of betrayal. Be aware of these different expectations—not only from students but often from faculty colleagues—and their harmful impact on evaluating women faculty members.

*You're supposed to always be chuckling and nurturing no matter what they do. You're not supposed to demand the same level of performance. You's the mammy.'*

Sherée Wilson, "They Forgot Mammy Had a Brain"

10. Value and expect scholarship and teaching on social justice and emancipative social thought

It is very important that people of color are not the only members of the faculty teaching these often-controversial and emotionally charged topics. Encourage all department faculty to incorporate information about these issues into their course content. In some disciplines, such as the humanities, social sciences, and education, all faculty members should be expected to cover this curricular content, which can make courses transformative for students and enrich the experience of the faculty members teaching the courses. Encourage deans to assess learning related to race/ethnicity, sexual identity, social class, and gender, as appropriate for the discipline. Afford faculty members the opportunity to develop new courses that explore these topics and reward them for doing so. Send a message about the importance of this curricular content by providing a small summer stipend, e.g., \$1000, as incentive for faculty to update their course materials and content. When only women and men of color explore these issues, the message students receive is that this content is not valid or important enough to be taught by white faculty. You also send a message about the value and legitimacy of faculty of color. At the same time, when faculty of color have expertise in these areas, tangibly value their competence and willingness to teach these topics.

*I do gain affirmation from many of my varied teaching experiences and from students of color, queer students, and white and working-class students who express their appreciation for my work in real, tangible ways. I also take great pride in the possibility that I am challenging those students suffering from white, upper-class, and heterosexual privilege.*

Grace Chang, "Where's the Violence? The Promise and Perils of Teaching Women of Color Studies"

*Recommendations for Women of Color and Allies*

1. There is no reason for you to be the only person whose course content includes issues of social justice and/or the intersections of race, ethnicity, socioeconomic status, and sexuality

Being the only person who teaches these issues may set you up to receive poor teaching evaluations because of students' unwillingness to have their existing views challenged, especially their beliefs about the racial history of the United States. It will also send a message to students that this content is not important or valid enough for white faculty to include it and that you teach these topics because you have a chip on your shoulder. In the disciplines within the social sciences, humanities, and education, in particular, there is no excuse for any faculty member to lack expertise on these issues. If your department head assigns only you to teach these emotionally-charged topics, then respectfully challenge the assignment and explain that you

are concerned about critical teaching evaluations that may be related more to the course content than to your competence. This situation is particularly anxiety producing if you are not yet tenured. Seek support from your dean if your department head is not supportive. When possible, take a break from teaching topics related to discrimination and prejudice. You might alternate semesters when you teach these topics, focusing on more emotionally neutral areas of your discipline during the other semesters. This practice will give you a much-needed respite from the physically and psychologically draining impacts of teaching the more controversial topics.

2. Do not use the classroom as a pulpit.

Do not abuse your privilege as a professor to pursue your personal and/or political agenda in the classroom and/or solicit student advocacy for your cries of racism or other -isms. It is unethical for you to expect or ask students to advocate for your personal views, especially when there may be negative consequences to them for doing so. Furthermore, when students lead a protest group and/or engage in discussions for change from a grass-roots level, they are much more powerful than when a faculty member is engaged with them in these efforts. Teaching means exposing students to critical examinations of diverse perspectives, not preaching your politically charged agenda. At the same time, however, it is appropriate to inform students of factual issues, histories, and/or situations that they may find challenging and/or anxiety-provoking in the context of a course that encompasses these topics. Let your ethical teaching and the information you present, relative to the appropriate course, be students' motivation for their actions.

3. Establish and assess learning outcomes for each of your courses

Course goals and expected learning outcomes should be clearly outlined in your course syllabus and in your teaching portfolio. Develop exams that correlate to expected learning outcomes for the course. Analyze your exam results with respect to these expectancies. In that manner, you will have data and evidence other than end-of-year teaching evaluations to attest to your success and competence in the classroom.

4. Develop a clear and detailed syllabus

The syllabus is your contract with students and your best protection from those who claim biased grading. Detail the manner in which students will be graded, the dates of exams, your expectations, and the university policies that are to be followed in the classroom, e.g., regarding plagiarism and accommodating students with disabilities. A word of caution—if you deviate from policies outlined in your syllabus on behalf of one student, you may be accused of discrimination by other students.

5. Immediately report abusive students to your department head and/or dean

If their responses are not helpful, seek help from your university human-resources and/or student-affairs offices. Document these situations in writing and retain the documentation. Seek support and advice from allies. If appropriate, seek guidance from the university attorney's office. Let the university police know what you are experiencing and, if appropriate, ask for their protection. If the university does not act, you may have to seek counsel and intervention from a private attorney and local or federal law enforcement agencies.

## 6. Conduct midsemester course evaluations

This process gives students the message that you care that they are learning the course content. It also affords you an opportunity to make a midcourse correction, if appropriate.

## Social Class, Tokenism, and the Search Process

### *Recommendations for Administrators*

1. Social-class challenges include those related to the hierarchical structure within the university as well as cultural differences between groups

Faculty in non-tenure-track positions, whose numbers are increasing, may be particularly vulnerable to bullying and other harmful treatment. They do not have the protection of tenure. They are often perceived as second- or third-class members of the faculty. You need to have policies in place to protect these members of the academy from the oppression of more powerful members.

*Rather, hierarchy and other distinctions in the legal academy take a different form and instead seem to be situated in the difference between tenure-track professors and everyone else, and between professors teaching at higher-ranked schools and the rest of us.*

Ruth Gordon, "On Community in the Midst of Hierarchy (and Hierarchy in the Midst of Community)"

Social-class differences may include family expectations, patterns of speech, emotional expression, responsibilities to communities, cultural mores, ways of expressing friendliness and warmth, music, and dress. Women of color cannot—and should not—reasonably be expected to change their culture because they have entered a white academic world. However, cultural differences may be misperceived, misinterpreted, and/or translated as not belonging to academia or noncollegial by their white colleagues and/or students. As much as possible, ensure that negative evaluations are not grounded in cultural differences.

*Unlike the evolution of gay identity in American society, there are no cool T-shirts, no exciting revelations, no working-class pride day, and really no recognizably celebrated culture . . . You can take the woman out of the working class, but you cannot take the working class out of the woman . . . My journey through the academy as a gay, working-class woman in an overwhelmingly straight, middle- and upper-middle-class male field, has been constrained by each of these social factors, but despite the intersectionality of these facets of identity, class is the least socially recognized and—perhaps for that reason—the most corrosive.*

Constance G. Anthony, "The Port Hueneme of My Mind: The Geography of Working-Class Consciousness in One Academic Career"

2. Be aware of the psychosocial consequences of tokenism and establish structures to minimize these effects

The effects of tokenism include high visibility, distinctiveness, loneliness, attributional ambiguity, stereotyping and racism, representativeness, and role encapsulation (Dovidio et al. 2001; Niemann 2011; Pollak and Niemann 1998; also see Niemann 2003 for a more thorough discussion of these effects). Tokens are highly visible, living in a glass house; their actions, words, demeanor, dress—virtually everything about them—is noticed in these environments. Memories about persons of color are often stereotype-consistent and have no basis in actual occurrences. Whether or not they wish to be, tokenized persons are seen as representatives of members of their distinctive group in their environment (Fiske and Taylor 1984; Steele 1997, 2010). Their failures, in particular, are seen as reflective of their demographic group, while their successes are considered exceptions to the rule or stereotype about their group.

*I knew if I failed in my quest to get tenure, it would be regarded as not just a personal failure. It is the plight of minorities to know that their whole subgroups may be judged by their individual behavior. If I failed, it might mean that no other black woman would be hired in the future. “We tried a black woman once. It didn’t work out” might be the refrain. Yet the administration would never say that the failure of one white male meant that another should never be hired again.*

Adrien Katherine Wing, “Lessons from a Portrait: Keep Calm and Carry On”

Tokens are seen stereotypically. For people of color, the stereotypes are largely negative, racist, and sexist, and there are damaging consequences of these perceptions. Tokenized persons feel isolated and lonely, not only on the campus, but sometimes in their predominantly white communities-at-large. Tokens experience attributional ambiguity; they do not know whom to trust. They do not know whether feedback they receive is valid, or if it is the result of biases, racism, sexism, or other -isms. Not to be able to trust feedback is not to know how to improve. They experience role encapsulation—assignments to projects associated with teaching topics related to historically underrepresented group and/or to the university’s diversity goals— as unpaid grant consultants, as university spokespersons, and as mascots for diversity (for a more detailed discussion of the effects of tokenism, see Niemann 2003; Niemann and Dovidio 1998a).

*Overall about 59 percent of the Latinas in this survey said that they were expected to be experts in Latin American and ethnic and/or gender politics—regardless of their training—because they are Latinas.*

Jessica Lavariega Monforti, “*La Lucha: Latinas Surviving Political Science*”

You will minimize or eliminate tokenization of faculty when you increase the numbers of historically underrepresented groups on your campus. The minimal point is for these persons to represent at least 15% of nonwhite, US-born, or domestic members in any given unit/department. In predominantly male fields,

e.g., engineering, females need to represent at least 15 percent of the total department members in tenure-track positions. Members of historically underrepresented groups will begin to achieve feelings of belonging and safety when their numbers reach a critical mass. In the meantime, following recommendations in this chapter will help diffuse or minimize the negative impacts of tokenism.

### 3. Do not turn people of color into mascots

As institutional leaders, be particularly sensitive to the possibility of turning people of color into mascots to demonstrate your institution's diversity to internal or external constituents. Do not assume that women of color will understand or accept your expectations for them in relation to the university's diversity efforts. Not all women of color want to participate in these efforts, especially prior to earning tenure. Be aware that you are placing faculty of color in an extremely uncomfortable position when you—as a person with authority and power—ask them to represent the school's diversity by appearing at on-campus or off-campus events designed to celebrate ethnic or racial holidays—particularly if there are very few faculty of color at the university. If they say no, do not retaliate against them for not being team players. Rather, respect their values and try to understand that they do not wish to be tokenized or they are simply too busy with academic responsibilities to engage in these activities. If women of color are expected, or agree, to contribute actively to the campus diversity mission, they should be rewarded in currency that is valued in the institution, such as teaching relief, increased salary, and/or positive impact on their evaluations.

*Then he said that I was spending too much of my time with people of color. He wanted to show me off more to white people. He tried to assure me that black people would love me, even if I did nothing for or with them. He laughed eerily as he explained that he wanted me to shun black folks and focus on white folks to help my image and that of the school. Oh no, I was staring in the face of the “just be our Negro” ghost.*

Angela Mae Kupenda, “Facing Down the Spooks”

Be aware that white curiosity about people of color may be based on stereotypes or the desire to seem “cool” or nonracist by befriending a person with a seemingly exotic background. The social lives of women of color are often very different from their professional ones. They often have to negotiate completely different identities and values, and their friends from home may be a completely different group from their professional colleagues. Therefore—even if you are genuinely curious—be respectful of people's privacy and do not intrude on the personal lives of faculty of color with probing questions. These more personal dialogues can occur after trust has been established between individuals.

*The problem he stated was that I did not tell him and my colleagues enough about my personal life. He said I was beginning to be much too private, just like the other woman of color on the faculty. . . . He wanted me to trust them more with the intimate details of my life. I explained that they already knew those details: I was single, had no children, was close to my family and friends, lived a quiet life, was active in my community, attended church, and enjoyed travel, my books, and the arts. . . . Growing*

*increasingly frustrated, he leaned forward in his chair, looked me straight in the eye, and with his ordinarily pale face turning red, he yelled, "You must trust us more if you want to succeed here; there are no spooks behind the door!"*

Angela Mae Kupenda, "Facing Down the Spooks"

4. Do not ask students or faculty of color to share their painful experiences to arouse white guilt or white empathy under the auspices of diversity training

This model of diversity training may be well intentioned, but it revictimizes persons of color, who do not typically believe they have an option when asked to participate in these training sessions. Be careful about mandating any type of diversity training across the entire faculty and/or student body. Such an order may generate resentment and/or retaliation toward people of color and result in little genuine learning. Instead, encourage training led by professionals in the area and ask for volunteer participants. You can also encourage small group discussions on topics of different experiential group realities on campus, led by students, faculty, and/or community members at grass roots levels.

*Administrators often want to "have it both ways" by having Natives on staff to count but also denying the importance of the Native voice. To add insult to injury, administrators also publicly voice support for Indigenous initiatives (especially at public gatherings with Indigenous community members) but privately work against supporting them (e.g., cutting or withholding funding, threatening or carrying out sanctions against protest activity, or allowing issues to die in committees and subcommittees that are looking further into the importance of these initiatives).*

Michelle M. Jacob, "Native Women Maintaining Their Culture in the White Academy"

5. Conduct searches that will yield a pool of faculty of color

If 90 percent of your workforce is white, or if almost all of your faculty of color are foreign nationals, there is a good chance that your university hiring process has a virus of overt and/or covert racism. In most academic fields, the availability of PhDs of color exceeds 10 percent, in some cases, significantly so (Ryu 2010). Add to that fact the ready availability of foreign nationals of color, and there is simply no excuse today for an all-white department or for a unit that has only one token faculty member of color. Encourage heads of search committees and all department heads and members of your leadership team to receive training from a professional who can help them understand the conscious and unconscious biases evoked during a search process. A competent and well-trained EEOC office and/or well-charged diversity office should participate in all faculty searches. These offices can provide lists of publications that target persons of color. Many of these outlets are online (e.g., *Hispanic Outlook* and *Diverse Issues in Higher Education*), and some of them are on free listservs. Advertisements in these outlets send a different message about your institution than do position announcements placed only in *The Chronicle of Higher Education*.

Deans may need to examine the entire pool of candidates, even before the finalists are selected. Ask the Affirmative Action/Equal Opportunity office to provide you with a list of candidates sorted by demographic category. Examine the candidacy materials of members of historically underrepresented groups. Add them to the pool of final candidates, if you deem them qualified. Inform department members and search committees that you will be more than glad to turn over this practice to them, but must be assured that every candidate from a historically underrepresented group is given strong, intentional consideration for the position. As an added measure, academic deans may need to interview each candidate of color personally, especially if a department has an all-white faculty. If you are a leader at a historically black college or university (HBCU), Hispanic-serving institution (HSI), or tribal college, is your faculty representative of the community you serve? If not, address the situation. In some HSIs, in particular, the majority of faculty are typically white, while most of the students are Latino/a.

*I sometimes feel like they [faculty] automatically assume I cannot possibly be here on my own merit. They just look right through me because someone in the admissions office made a mistake. Girls don't do science, but black girls especially don't.*

Deirdre M. Bowen, "Visibly Invisible: The Burden of Race and Gender for Female Students of Color Striving for an Academic Career in the Sciences"

Reward women of color for serving as consultants on a search, but remember that there is a fine line between being consulted and being held responsible. Beware of the pitfall of expecting people of color to know and to find all the other people of color who may be qualified for the job. It is not their job to diversify the department or campus, and you should not expect them to be the primary salespersons for the job. If the university or community cultural climate is hostile to members of historically underrepresented groups, it may be very difficult for members of these groups to recommend that faculty work at their campus.

*But then the department head said, "Well, I'm just going to be honest with you. You're going to get this job because you're black and a woman. So we're going to give you this job. But we're going to hire someone else for the job we advertised."*

Serena Easton, "On Being Special"

6. Word your job ads in a way that lets faculty of color know that their unique skills and experiences are particularly welcome

Your posted job qualifications should communicate that you value unique contributions of members of underrepresented groups. State that you require or strongly prefer significant experience with diverse communities. Go beyond the typically used, but meaningless phrases, "University XXX is an affirmative action employer," or "Women and minorities are encouraged to apply." Remember that students of color, in particular, often find role models and community among faculty of color, which facilitates student retention for students and faculty.



*Native American students across campus stopped by my office just to meet me or to visit. They said they had heard there was a new Native American faculty member on campus and they just wanted to meet me and know it was possible to get through school. Having never experienced a Native American faculty member, I did not understand the power this had and was surprised by how much it meant to Native American students that I was just there.*

Beth A. Boyd, "Sharing Our Gifts"

#### 7. How is merit is defined across campus?

Does merit mean the candidate graduated from an elite institution or comes with a "pedigree?" Does it mean upper social class? Due to the racism and discriminatory history of people of color in the United States, members of historically underrepresented groups are less likely than their white counterparts to have attended an elite institution. What is the role of standardized tests in your admission process for undergraduate and graduate students? Given the strong correlation between socioeconomic status and test scores (Sacks 2007), as well as the research findings that standardized college entrance exams do not predict college success more significantly than does high-school grade-point average, why does your school use them? What is the empirically demonstrated value of graduate school screening exams, e.g., the GRE, MCAT, . . . ? Understand that the presence of students of color attracts faculty and administrators of color, and vice versa.

*Our hope—as these essays attest—is that we can offer a method grounded in justice, reconciliation, and faith in a future guided less by rhetoric and promise and measured more by realistic goals and our true achievements.*

Deena J. González, "Introduction," Part V

#### 8. Avoid sham searches

Particularly for high-level, visible positions, searches are often conducted as a façade. A typical situation for a sham search occurs when an interim or internal candidate, or a personal acquaintance of the department head, dean, or president, is the preferred and preordained choice. Nevertheless, the university must put up a front of fairness and equal opportunity for legal, funding, reputation, and policy reasons. Consequently, the search proceeds with several candidates who in reality have no chance of obtaining the position. People of color are especially vulnerable in these façade searches because they are often included in campus interviews so that the search committee and university can claim they considered a diverse pool of candidates. Avoid these games. Not only are they unethical, but word of the dishonesty gets around quickly, impacting your university's reputation and the willingness of women of color to work there. Avoid appointing interim candidates who are interested in the permanent position, and you will increase the likelihood of a meaningful external search. For administrative positions, it is especially important that the hiring administrator review the applicant pool for qualified members of historically underrepresented groups who may be overlooked by a biased search committee.

*For years women of color have been an extremely attractive group to administrators in academia. Besides the ideological benefit of providing female and minority students with successful role models, they have had the practical advantage of counting as a “twofer” in affirmative-action accounting. However, once they have been brought through the doors of the university, their experiences belie their value to the academy, as reflected in the essays in this book.*

John F. Dovidio, “Introduction,” Part II

9. Require understanding and implications of state and federal affirmative-action policies and consider the pros and cons of opportunity hires

Even in states where consideration of a candidate’s race and gender for hiring is illegal, federal affirmative action is still the law (Rai and Critzer 2000). Affirmative action to create a diverse candidate pool is not illegal—anywhere in the United States. Ensure that your search committees understand this distinction. The history of racism and discrimination in the United States has resulted in *de facto* preference for white men and women in the academy (Katznelson 2005). As evidenced by the very low numbers of people of color in the academy relative to their availability, this white preference continues to be very strong today. Acknowledge the negative impact of historical and ongoing white preferences as you make a case for recruitment, hiring, and retention of faculty of color. Point out the existing demographic data on your campus faculty, which privileges white males. Help students and faculty understand the value of a heterogeneous faculty for preparing students for today’s world.

Because of the negative biases associated with affirmative action (Heilman 1996; Heilman, Block, and Lucas 1992; Heilman, Block, and Stathatos 1997), reconsider the pros and cons of *opportunity hires*, or employment that takes place outside of the typical searches conducted in compliance with standard university hiring procedures. Despite the good intentions of such policies, an opportunity-hire policy can work against the diversity goals of the institution. For instance, a department may select a white candidate for a position—although a woman of color was also an excellent candidate—with the justification that “the provost can pay for the diversity hire; we don’t have to use our department funds for her.” This practice can result in the ghettoization of candidates of color. In most cases, it is better to have a good, broad, inclusive search—led by a person trained to avert racist, classist, homophobic, and sexist biases—through job ads placed in publications that target people of color than it is to have an opportunity-hire policy.

*But something bizarre did happen. . . . I got to the teaching demonstration, and no faculty . . . were present. . . . I was their affirmative-action hire, and they were going to give me special treatment by gifting me with the position. . . . It’s not that we don’t know that we may be beneficiaries of affirmative action. Of course we know. But no candidate or faculty member wants to feel patronized, humiliated, or treated with condescension as if they are wholly unqualified for the position they are seeking. They particularly don’t want this kind of treatment after they have fought tooth*

*and nail within a context of inequality to get where they are. And yet this department head had gone out of his way to treat me this way.*

Serena Easton, "On Being Special"

### *Recommendations for Women of Color and Allies*

1. People of color who are tokenized experience personal and career-damaging impacts of this context

It is critical that you remember that the psychological experiences associated with tokenism, described earlier in this chapter (see also Niemann 2003; Niemann 2011; Niemann and Dovidio, 1998a) are about the situation, not about you. You will need mentors, friends, family, and allies to help you negotiate these experiences that may be harmful to your career and your mental and physical health.

2. Try not to allow yourself to be tokenized or showcased as an example of diversity in a predominantly white institution

You may have to explain to administrators, in a professional manner, why you cannot maintain your integrity and dignity while being put on display. Try not to succumb to pressure to perform. Until you have developed trust with colleagues, maintain your privacy when intrusive colleagues attempt to question you about your life outside the workplace. Tactfully make clear that you value your privacy. Try not to feel pressured to socialize with people you do not want to be with. Stay away from diversity-training models that use the pain of participants of color as their major teaching tools for white members of the institution. Do not dumb down to be liked or seen as nonthreatening but try to be aware of the way your actions, speech, and achievements are being perceived.

3. Numbers matter

Remember that the challenges you are experiencing are not about you; they are about the situation, especially relative to the very small numbers of members of historically underrepresented groups at your university. The research on the psychology of token status documents its negative impacts. Help change the situation by becoming engaged—informally and formally—in faculty searches when possible, but only if you can do so without jeopardizing your successful tenure trajectory. Send job ads to various networks in and out of the discipline in question. Ask people to spread the word about the job announcement. At the same time, understand that you are not responsible for changing the diversity of the campus. If you are asked to participate in a number of search committees beyond that expected of your colleagues, request a reduced teaching load to compensate for the time spent. You must remember that excellent teaching and scholarly productivity, not service, are almost always the areas considered for tenure, promotion, and salary increases. If you work at an HBCU, HSI, or tribal college, understand that you may still experience the issues addressed in the narratives in this volume. It is not a given that the majority of faculty in these institutions are faculty of color or that they will treat you better than do your white colleagues.

4. Try to avoid being a sham or token candidate for an advertised position

Reconsider being a candidate for a position if an interim appointee is also among the candidates; your candidacy in this search could be a no-win situation for you. It may be that you are being used to create a diverse pool for the position and will be wasting your time. When administrators are serious about external searches, they will not appoint interims who want the position permanently. Even if the upper administration wants an outsider, in all likelihood the faculty will press for the internal or interim candidate, especially when the alternative is an unknown person of color. Do not assume that the presence of an external search firm mitigates the likelihood of a sham search. Make inquiries; ask colleagues in your discipline and mentors questions about the standing of the internal candidate.

5. Remember that every university has had—and most still have—*de facto* preferences for white males and females (Katznelson 2005; Rai and Critzer 2000)

Your understanding of academia's long-standing historical preferences for white members will help you personally manage and respond to others' assumptions and overtly racist accusations that you were only hired due to affirmative action or community pressure. A look at the data is all you need to confirm the dominance of white faculty and administrators in the academy (for detailed data, see Ryu 2010). The data for your institution are generally posted on your institutional research website. However, you do not need to spend your time convincing others of this status quo. Just know it. In addition, be aware of what state and federal laws permit and require; you may need to correct misinformation on these matters, especially if you serve on search committees. Furthermore, be aware of the racist baggage sometimes associated with being an opportunity hire. When opportunity hires are white—as with accommodating spouses or particular expertise—these situations are received much more positively with attitudes that consider them good fortune. In contrast, when this hiring occurs in efforts to increase campus racial/ethnic diversity, it tends to be received with resentment.

## Tenure and Promotion

### *Recommendations for Administrators*

1. Make tenure and promotion policies as transparent as possible

Probably nothing creates as much angst for faculty as the tenure and promotion process. Good, well-meaning administrators can fall into the landmine of not providing adequate, transparent information about what it takes to earn tenure at their institutions. Many administrators make assumptions that the quality of mentorship across the campus is good and expect that faculty members know the rules of the game for success. They underestimate the level of isolation of faculty caught within the intersections of race/ethnicity/class and gender and sexual identities.

Send your faculty copies of tenure and promotion policies along with their letter of offer, accompanied by a signature page to be returned to you that acknowledges that they have received and read the policies. Develop workshops for junior faculty on the expectations of an excellent tenure and promotion binder. Provide concrete

guidance on what to include in a good self-assessment letter: what information do your committees look for and need to know to evaluate the candidate? Let faculty know the makeup of the tenure and promotion committees and how you select external reviewers. Train department heads to mentor their faculty through this process, including beginning the development of the portfolio from the first day on the job. Develop workshops for tenured associate professors and encourage their transition to full professor. Many women of color get stuck at the associate-professor level, especially those with service responsibilities, thereby limiting their options for administrative advancement.

*I learned that becoming too involved in service activities, serving on every committee on campus because it needed an ethnic-minority member for EEOC reasons, spending proportionately too much time with students, mentoring an overly broad program of research, and generally getting spread too thin are all traps that ethnic-minority faculty members tend to fall into but which will not be rewarded by promotion and tenure.*

Beth A. Boyd, "Sharing Our Gifts"

2. Be careful of assignments that will prevent women of color from engaging in their required research scholarly productivity

These assignments include excess advising, using the justification that "students are attracted to her because she is a woman of color." They include service on department, college, university, or community committees that is out of proportion to that expected of white male faculty. Such assignments are often unfairly rationalized due to the need to "diversify" a committee. These assignments also include teaching overload courses and/or preparation for new courses that is not expected of white male faculty. In general, assignments to and responsibilities of members of historically underrepresented groups should be equal or equitable to those of white male faculty. Department heads have a particular responsibility to protect junior faculty from service and/or teaching and student advising, including chairing thesis and dissertation committees, that will detract from research/creative scholarly expectations. Outstanding assignments beyond the scope of reasonable expectations must be compensated in a meaningful manner.

*"We know you are concerned about becoming a scholar and getting tenure, but we can't afford for you to work on your research this summer. . . . We need you to teach in the summer program because you are black, you are a woman, you are a great teacher, and you nurture, mother, feed, and nurse all the students."*

Angela Mae Kupenda, "Facing Down the Spooks"

3. Address the culture of privilege and entitlement

Every university has a significant number—some far greater than others—of persons with tenure who have ceased to be productive. These persons have essentially retired in place. Due to historical conditions of access to the university, most of these persons are white males, followed by white females. The problems with this situation are beyond the scope of this chapter, but a few are particularly relevant to

the experiences of women of color. First, these tenured, non-active faculty members are holding positions that could be opened up for searches to bring in fresh perspectives and diversity and open doors to women of color. Secondly, these persons are the most likely to be insecure about their lack of productivity, most resistant to concepts and arguments about historical white male privilege, and most threatened and/or intimidated by successful women of color (Sue 2010; Wise 2010). Conscious and unconscious racist attitudes underlie and exacerbate the matter. Third, senior faculty with attitudes of self-entitlement and privilege may be the ones most likely to engage in bullying and coercion of junior faculty, especially women of color (Cavaiola and Lavender 2000). You can challenge this situation without threatening tenure by insisting on meaningful, outcome-oriented yearly post-tenure reviews that challenge the culture of privilege and entitlement.

*“We had a faculty member who really should have been asked to retire some time ago, and we were in a committee meeting . . . He went totally off on me. Stood up, started spitting in my face, talking about ‘you people.’: ‘What’s wrong with you people?’ . . . My white colleagues left the room—ran out. Yes, they did. Debra, bless her heart, she stayed and tried to defend me, but then he started attacking her. . . . This faculty member had just been bizarre, just had done awful things, and it was tolerated.”*

Sherée Wilson, “They Forgot Mammy Had a Brain”

#### 4. Faculty members perceive women of color through their own biased lenses

Unconscious bias is likely to be exacerbated when the number of people of color in a department is relatively small; the women of color in a department are objectively more competent, successful, and/or productive than their white counterparts; and/or women of color have authority and/or power over whites, such as when they are department heads, deans, provosts, or presidents (Dovidio and Gaertner 2010). In these situations, familiar stereotypes are likely to converge with garden-variety resentment and insecurity to create an atmosphere of hostility toward the women. As is the case with students, male and female faculty across race/ethnicity may resent the authority and power of women of color. The perceivers’ biases affect evaluations and perceptions of collegiality. Color-insight discussion groups with small groups of faculty who volunteer to participate will slowly facilitate a cultural shift away from these harmful biases.

*For example, our research and the work of others show that blacks, Asians, and white women who have impeccable qualifications may be hired or promoted at rates comparable to those of white men, but when their record is anything short of perfect, they are victimized by discrimination. In these cases, decision makers weigh the strongest credentials of white men most heavily while they systemically shift their standards and focus on the weakest aspects of racial minorities. The process often occurs unconsciously, even among people who believe that they are not racist or sexist. Moreover, because people justify their decisions on the basis of something other than race or sex—how a particular aspect of the record falls short of the standards, for example—they fail to understand the way racism or sexism*

*operated indirectly to shape the qualities they valued or devalued and, ultimately, what they decided.*

John F. Dovidio, "Introduction," Part II

5. Ensure due process throughout the institution and remember that equity is sometimes more important than equality

The best protection against discrimination by and toward any members of the institution is insistence that administrators follow the same policies and evaluative structure for every member of the academy. Department heads are key points of connection and relationship building between faculty and the university. It is, therefore, especially important to conduct department-head training that emphasizes due process for all. Department heads must also understand the difference between equality and equity. An example of inequitable evaluation is demanding differential contributions to service, and then expecting those with the higher service expectations to have the same number of publications as those who do minimal service for the institution and community at large. Another example of inequity is expecting a woman who was on family-related leave for one year and stopped the tenure clock during that time, to have more publications/creative productivity than a person who went through the tenure process in the standard time period. That practice may be unconscious as evaluators count the number of publications per year, without taking into consideration the meaning and significance of an approved leave of absence. Policies should be put in place to avoid this practice.

*The service component was proving the most overwhelming. . . . I was inundated with requests for assistance from black law graduate and undergraduate students, as well as other black professors and staff on campus, not to mention other students and faculty who had heard that I was someone who would listen to their concerns. . . . I was asked to serve on several time-consuming campus wide committees and invited to make presentations at numerous national and international venues. Various groups . . . all wanted me to get involved with their committees or activities. . . . I could not wall myself up in an ivory tower writing my articles and wait to get involved in the world until after tenure.*

Adrien Katherine Wing, "Lessons from a Portrait: Keep Calm and Carry On"

6. Define and describe the role of collegiality

Most tenure and promotion policies stipulate requirements for research, service, and teaching. However, underlying the interpretation of these accomplishments is the issue of collegiality. Part of knowing the rules of the game is understanding the role that perceived collegiality plays in faculty success and even the definition of collegiality within a given context. For instance, persons who refuse to be treated as mascots may be deemed poor team players by their peers and/or supervisors. Policies and practices regarding the definition of collegiality should be apparent.

*I did not understand what noncollegial or even collegiality, for that matter, meant in my new world, the hierarchical realm of the institution that*

*would decide my post-PhD future. I was unaware of the secret social norms and behaviors.*

Francisca de la Riva-Holly, "Iqualadas"

7. Respect the significance of group-based research and teaching contributions by members of underrepresented groups

The university decides the way to define "merit." Therefore, there is simply no reason for group-based research and/or teaching related to prejudice and discrimination to be devalued in any discipline. This work adds richness and depth to students' understanding of their world and the scholarship of their disciplines. Yet, these negative judgments are often made, derailing the tenure and promotion process for members of underrepresented groups.

*For instance, one senior faculty member stopped me in the hall one day and asked—regarding a graduate-student fellowship the ethnic-studies program was offering—"If one of our students accepts that fellowship, will they have to do Mexican shit, or can they do real research?"*

Yolanda Flores Niemann, "The Making of a Token: A Case Study of Stereotype Threat, Stigma, Racism, and Tokenism in Academe"

*"When I tried to create curricula to suit our largely Latino student body, I was told that I was ghettoizing the department."*

Jessica Lavariega Monforti, "La Lucha: Latinas Surviving Political Science"

8. Take community service into account when you consider tenure, promotion, and compensation

Every university needs to carefully review practice and policies regarding the way faculty are rewarded for service work on and off campus. This examination should ideally include empirical evidence of either similarities or disparities between the service of women of color and other faculty with appropriate follow-up. Women of color often struggle with conflicting demands. They may feel value driven to support other people of color in their academic and geographic community. Students often ask for their advice and guidance on personal, as well as academic, matters. Faculty of color are often treated as family representatives for and by students of color, especially those whose home is a significant distance from the campus. This mentorship takes much time and energy and may conflict with institutional priorities that are part of the faculty member's evaluations. Deans and department heads can help diffuse their responsibilities by providing diversity training to all faculty members and assigning community service tasks that relate to race/ethnic/sexual-orientation groups and student advising to all trained faculty.

Deans can support the collective cultural/racial projects of their faculty in other ways as well. For example, if American Indian/Native American faculty are leading projects on reservations, can their teaching load be reduced? Sometimes equity makes more sense than equality. When performing an equity review, look at advising loads and service to community. Just counting numbers of courses, students in



courses, and publications and grants is not enough. What else is the person doing that is valued by the university? How is the university demonstrating in significant ways the value of this work? If you do not value the work enough to reward it, be direct and forthright with faculty of color about this attitude. That information is critical for the faculty member to make an informed decision about the consequences of proceeding with the service work.

*The academy values individualism and a commitment to the institution's inflexible bureaucratic guidelines while Marie and her Native community, including people she invites for campus events, value collectivism and commitment to family.*

Michelle M. Jacob, "Native Women Maintaining Their Culture in the White Academy"

9. Establish a mentoring training program and assign trained mentors

Effective mentorship is critical to the success of women of color. Before you assign mentors, however, develop and implement training on how to be an effective mentor. Most people are not experienced in mentoring, in general, and especially not across demographic lines of ethnicity/race, social class, or sexual orientation; they may not know what it means to be a good mentor in these contexts. Some persons do not understand that mentorship is something more than writing letters of recommendation. What are the expectations? How do good mentors go about advancing the development of advisees? Do they understand the difference between mentoring and patronizing, and know that the latter is demeaning and insulting?

Mentors are generally full professors and/or administrators who know the rules of the academic game. They can teach mentees ways to navigate the academic culture, which tends to incorporate upper-middle-class behavioral norms, including communication styles. For instance, people who are raised in working-class families, including many people of color, are more likely to speak in more direct, forthright ways. Directness can be intimidating, however, to people reared in white upper-middle to upper-class families. Mentors must also help women of color navigate inappropriate expectations, e.g., teaching diversity-related courses for which they have no training or interest. Mentors need to understand the psychological struggle of being the first member of a group in an environment. Mentors must also help women of color transcend cultural values of humility as they develop self-assessment letters for tenure and/or promotion portfolios. For instance, many American Indian women struggle with what they perceive as bragging when they put together their portfolios. The value of humility is paramount in American Indian cultures, as well as other cultures of color.

White men and women who acknowledge their white privilege and value intersectionalities can be excellent mentors to women of color. They are most likely to know the rules of the game and can provide outstanding guidance, support, and advocacy. At the same time, it is crucial that some white faculty who exhibit a missionary and/or patronizing attitude *never* serve as mentors to women of color. Department chairs should speak to both faculty mentors and mentees before determining assignments, rather than making assumptions about faculty wishes or just

following a rotation schedule. Mentors from within and outside of the faculty members' departments, and even from outside the university, can be helpful. Upper-level administrators can engage in very powerful mentoring; this modeling sends a message about the importance of the process.

*We women of color have to learn the skill of self-promotion and also become comfortable with being boastful, flaunting our accomplishments, and ensuring we receive due credit for our work.*

Linda Trinh Vō, "Navigating the Academic Terrain:  
The Racial and Gender Politics of Elusive Belonging"

10. Develop a formal grievance process that affords the grievant a realistic and fair opportunity to win his or her case

Most grievance-related policies are written in a way that the university can almost never lose, except in the cases of flagrant disregard of policy. The latter is relatively rare because university administrators frame most situations as different interpretations of policy (e.g., perceived value of research and teaching), rather than disregard. Develop a faculty review team to evaluate complaints and make recommendations to administrative decision makers.

*A few of these professors began a smear campaign in which they demanded that I be removed as editor-in-chief. They wrote numerous letters to the professor who had asked me to take over the helm, and they also wrote many letters and made repeated telephone calls to the dean, provost, and president of WSU [Washington State University]. I was mortified. I had never experienced such vitriol, and I did not know how to handle such an attack.*

Kelly Ervin, "The Experiences of an Academic 'Misfit'"

11. Framing matters

Keep in mind that tenure and promotion committees, department heads, and other administrators—depending on their motivation—may frame a faculty's member's portfolio so that even the most accomplished person looks like a failure and the most unaccomplished one looks like a success. For example, expectations that women—especially women of color—should be nurturing may undermine the success of someone whose nurturing parallels that of most men whose evaluations are not harmed if they do not nurture students. Expect upper-level tenure and promotion committees to evaluate the entire portfolio for themselves, and not just read the recommendations of decision makers, some of whom might have interpreted the file with a negative bias.

*Ultimately, though, there is a continual danger of being constructed as a hostile Injun or friendly squaw.*

Michelle M. Jacob, "Native Women Maintaining Their  
Culture in the White Academy"

12. Caution women about the challenges and risks associated with joint appointments

Given the preexisting pressure and demand on women of color, joint or split appointments may be disastrous for women of color unless you ensure that they are supported. Remember that there is really no such thing as a fifty-fifty time commitment. The department heads involved will place competing teaching, research, advising, and other service demands on jointly appointed faculty. Ideally, appoint a faculty member to one section of the university with a buyout possibility for teaching and/or research in others.

*To womyn of color who are contemplating a joint appointment, I would say ascertain specifics about the structure of the assignment being considered, including the expectations of both departments and their past experience and knowledge of what is involved to make the structure work. . . . Make sure you have in writing all of the benefits from the joint appointment and a clear delineation of the roles and responsibilities expected from the position.*

Michelle A Holling, May Fu, and Roe Bubar, "Dis/  
Jointed Appointments: Solidarity amidst Inequality,  
Tokenism, and Marginalization"

13. Persons in token situations expend much energy spent on impression management

Understand that—due to the consequences of tokenism and their small numbers in the institution—women of color typically expend much energy on efforts to manage the impressions they make on others. They live in a glass house. Their uniqueness in the white academic environment attracts attention to every aspect of the communication and behavior. You can minimize the need for excessive impression management efforts by providing concrete, constructive feedback and guidance, which will lead to increased self-confidence and less need for energy spent on impression management. A trusted mentor is invaluable in this regard.

*The simultaneity of being invisible and hypervisible has meant that I customarily operate in a state of alertness. I watch/observe while I am being watched/observed. In the classroom, I am mindful of every look or stare, of every whisper, and I am cognizant of the ever-present undercurrent of white allegiances/alliances that often commence partway through a course and continue until the end.*

Delia D. Douglas, "Black/Out: The White Face of  
Multiculturalism and the Violence of the Canadian  
Academic Imperial Agenda"

14. Department heads make a difference

In almost all universities, the department head/chair is the main lifeline for women of color, indeed for all faculty. The faculty's relationship with you is often reflected in their feelings about the university. You are their primary administrator, protector, and professional-development mentor. To the extent of your power, you

need to protect women of color from excess service, unwanted summer teaching, and paid and unpaid overloads. But you also need to understand that their cultural values prompt people of color to engage in serving the community-at-large and advising individuals and student groups. If the university values this work, you can release women of color from other responsibilities to ensure equitable time for them to attend to their scholarship and teaching. On the other hand, be forthright about which of their contributions will be considered for tenure, promotion, and/or yearly evaluation and salary increases.

You also need to protect women of color from senior faculty, some of whom may engage in harassment, bullying, and/or coercive behavior, especially when junior faculty do not support their causes and/or agenda. Be aware that women of color are sometimes named on grants as consultants, especially when the agency values a diverse research or creative team. In these cases, ensure that the women of color are named as co-PIs (principal investigators) and not just consultants. Do not be bashful about seeking advice from administrators and/or faculty within and outside your institution about supervising women of color.

Women from minority gender and sexual identity groups may be most vulnerable to harassment and violence—from students, faculty, staff, and community members. Connect these women to support groups and pay particular attention to ways in which students and faculty may impart their contempt for these group members via their end-of-course and yearly evaluations.

*. . . when I finally began to ask questions about how the psychology we were learning related to ethnic minorities and their communities, I was told that this had nothing to do with psychology.*

Beth A. Boyd, "Sharing Our Gifts"

### *Recommendations for Women of Color and Allies*

#### 1. Study the tenure and promotion materials of your university

Speak with recently promoted faculty about the expectations; ask to see copies of their portfolios. Learn how to develop a good self-assessment letter; this letter should include information about the quality of the venues where your works are published, displayed, performed, etc. What is the significance of those sites? Why are these bragging points for you and the university? Begin developing your tenure portfolio on your first day on the job. Obtain the binder where your work will be submitted and begin filling it as you complete your scholarly projects (your department staff can provide guidance). Remember that until a work is published or "in press" (with documentation), it is not complete and does not count toward your achievements. Your third-year review will come more quickly than you expect, so you do not have time to waste. Do not sit on revise-and-resubmit opportunities; complete the work. When you give conference presentations, turn those into publications—immediately. You must be a productive scholar to be successful at research universities. Mentors can be invaluable throughout this process. If you are tenured, continue your productivity until you reach full professor. You must have this rank if you want a reasonable chance to attain and succeed in administrative positions.

Place boundaries on your service commitments. In most universities, service above and beyond the nominal work expected of a good department and university

citizen is not rewarded. Understand that excess service does not take the place of expected scholarly productivity for your review. Use your time wisely and effectively. Structure your time that is not allocated to classroom teaching. If you manage your schedule well, you can still have a balanced life that includes teaching, scholarship, service, family, and personal time. Time management is one of the most essential components of a successful career and gratifying personal life.

If the president develops a task force to address faculty diversity, provide your concrete, solution-oriented input. However, if the committee is not action- and/or outcome-oriented, politely decline or serve with an understanding that your responsibilities will be appropriately lightened. You must be realistic about what changes you have the power to produce.

## 2. Women of color often invest much energy in impression management

You are living in a glass house when you work for a predominantly white institution. People comment on things about you that they do not notice about your white colleagues. These things include your dress, opinions and contributions during meetings or events on or off campus, food and music preferences, etc. You will face negative reactions for not meeting stereotypical expectations, which can also result in severe stress. At the same time, you become very aware that—to the majority of persons in your academic environment—you represent members of your underrepresented group, thereby increasing the pressure you feel about the way you are perceived.

Share your feelings and reactions with other people of color. Find a trusted friend and/or mentor who will give you honest feedback about how you are perceived by others. If you want to make a different impression and it is in your power to do so, obtain guidance on strategies to achieve the outcome you desire. Persons in public relations, life coaching, and acting fields may be helpful. You might also consider hiring a professional consultant in this area. Remember that you still have to produce excellent scholarship and teaching, no matter how much energy you are expending on other matters.

## 3. Women of color are especially subject to negative consequences of attributional ambiguity

*Attributional ambiguity* means that you may not know whether the treatment you receive is due to biases about your race/ethnicity, culture, sexual identity, or gender, or whether it is good, unbiased, and informed feedback. Not knowing whom you can trust negatively impacts your advancement. You need reliable feedback, and a trusted and competent mentor is invaluable in this area. Mentors can help you understand the rules of the game at your institution. Let the mentor know what you need and want. Communications between mentor and mentee are not the time to be bashful. Ask about language, communication styles, clothing, even office decorations—whatever you think sends messages about you. At the same time, you want to maintain your personal integrity and identity, so make informed decisions about what you do and do not want to change. Ask mentors about valued venues for your work. They may be able to review your work and advise you how to respond to invitations to revise and resubmit journal articles. Follow their informed advice; target those journals, presses, galleries, and other venues appropriate for your discipline.

Alternately, let mentors help you educate your department chair about the prestige of other venues for your work.

Develop your own network of mentors. They do not have to be people of color, and they do not have to be women. Due to their entrenchment and privilege in the academy, white men tend to know the playing rules better than members of any other group. Some of these white men will genuinely care about you and make efforts to promote your development and advance your successes. Recognize, however, that what works for white men may not work for you. At the same, beware of the missionary instincts of some white faculty, who need to believe that they are more talented than people of color; this attitude results in patronizing, which you will sense and resent. If this happens to you, or you do not agree with an assigned mentor, speak with your department head about changing your assignment. When possible, ask the department head to consult with you before appointing a new mentor.

4. When addressing change, pick your battles

Focus on what is in your power to challenge, change, or address. You will have to learn to put aside hurt feelings, humiliation, and rumination about poor treatment. Fight for fairness but be ready to let go when it becomes clear that it is a losing battle, or you may be the main casualty. Try not to be the only person out on a limb on any given issue. You need support. Be aware of and challenge—through your department head—unequal treatment, such as unequal distributions of labor that some senior professors may attempt to justify. Most of all, remember that people's attitudes toward you often say a lot more about them than about you. As a person inside the academy, you will see poor treatment and misjudgment of colleagues of color from the inside (Turner and Myers 2000), which will create stress for you as you vicariously experience these situations. When possible, take a break from emotionally charged assignments and service. Although it is very difficult, try not to take racist, sexist, homophobic, and/or classist treatment personally. Find support; learn what you can live with. When necessary, seek a different university environment in which to work. Just because some of your colleagues do not acknowledge your value does not mean you are not exceptionally important to the academic world. Remember that you have to focus on your work to be successful.

5. Do not assume that the university will reward you for community service and engagement

Along with others, you can work toward making this reward system happen, but until it does, understand that you may be sacrificing your career by fulfilling community service. Guest lectures, consulting work in the community, and advising student groups may mean extra, noncompensated, and unvalued work for you. Understand that nonacademics in your community may not recognize how much time you must devote to your job to be successful. Consider telling people who make these requests that you can participate in larger, time-consuming community projects after you have earned tenure and/or full professor status. Explain that you want to be at the university long enough to have the privilege of serving your community and that—if you do not progress through the academic ranks and achieve tenure—your time at the institution may be very short, and you may never have the freedom to work on their projects. In the meantime, refer them to appropriate people who

can help. Develop trusted faculty networks that can advise students of color and work on various community-service projects. Be selective serving on graduate theses and dissertation committees, which are very time-consuming, especially if you are the chair. Before agreeing to serve as an advisor to student groups, learn what the group expects of you; do not accept the invitation unless you have the time to complete your scholarly expectations.

6. Work away from your office

Consider working away from your office at least one or two days or afternoons per week and use this time to produce the scholarly/creative work upon which you will be evaluated. You need to develop a plan where you can work in an uninterrupted environment. You must be a productive scholar as defined by your discipline.

7. Regarding performance evaluation, learn to make a case for equity, not just equality

For instance, if you can document extraordinary advising compared to your colleagues, you may have a good case for a reduced teaching load. Documentation is the operative word here. You may also have a good reason for teaching to count more than publications in your annual reviews. However, you must not make presumptions. Discuss the matter at length and in concrete terms with your department head. Document in writing, with appropriate signatures, any agreements that you make with supervisors and/or evaluation committees. Unless any deviations from standard expectations have been documented as approved, expect to be evaluated using the same standards as your colleagues who have not performed extraordinary service or had higher teaching loads.

8. Your success can be intimidating and threatening, not only to insecure white colleagues but also to some colleagues of color who have internalized racist, homophobic, and sexist ideologies

Women of color are often criticized by colleagues across rank, race/ethnicity, and gender and sexual identities. Some faculty-of-color colleagues seek external excuses for their shortcomings or lack of success. Some of these persons use racism and other -isms as reasons for their failures and discontent. As such, your success undermines their excuses. They may also be accustomed to being the only member of their group and feel displaced and insecure when you reduce their authority to deliver the minority perspective. As a professor, you may find that the students of color who flock to your classes are the same ones who most test your authority. They may see you as an outsider because they perceive your social class is higher and/or because you do not advocate their political ideology or cause. If you advance to administrative positions, be prepared for comparatively unsuccessful faculty of color to call you a traitor, "oreo," and/or other demeaning and racist terms.

Some men of color—especially those from highly patriarchal cultures—will challenge your authority to evaluate them, particularly when the appraisal is negative. These insecure people will like and accept you only as long as you cater to their wishes, advocate their causes, and subscribe to their views of themselves. Reject their attempts to race-bait, belittle, or guilt-trip you. Do not engage in rank-ordering oppression. Continue being successful and maintain your integrity. Do your best in whatever position you hold.

9. Do not assume that every negative experience or action toward you is grounded in racial, gender, or sexual-identity bias

When you believe that you have experienced or observed an injustice, try to produce compelling evidence to support the charge. Remember that not every negative experience or evaluation is about your race/ethnicity/gender/gender or sexual identity. In some cases, rude behavior toward you is not about you at all; the perpetrator may behave in that manner toward all persons. Be careful not to allege racism without foundation. If you do so, you will be dismissed as a whiner and someone who is angry, lacks personal responsibility and accountability, and blames everything in life on your race/ethnicity and/or sex. Most importantly, your empty cries of racism will undermine the validity of legitimate complaints by yourself and others.

10. Develop teaching portfolios

These are the equivalent of tenure portfolios but are dedicated to teaching. They include a statement of your teaching philosophy, documentation of your assessment of what was learned in all your courses, syllabi, intermittent student feedback, and your response to that feedback (see Seldin 2004 and Seldin and Miller 2009 for a thorough explanation and samples). They also include examples of your teaching outside the classroom, e.g., at conferences, as a consultant, and in the community-at-large. Well-prepared teaching portfolios are good protection against retaliatory course evaluations and negative evaluations by students who do not want to hear about issues of race/ethnicity. You must be proactive, or administrators may just use standard end-of-year student evaluations to assess your teaching.

Ask experienced senior teachers to sit in on your classes and write an assessment to include in your tenure and promotion portfolio. Preferably they will visit your classroom more than once so they can get an accurate sense of your relationship with students. This observation is particularly important if you begin to experience hostility from your students. A mentor or trusted friend can help you remedy the situation and also attest to inappropriate student comments and behavior so that you are not caught in a he said/she said argument about your classroom behavior. Developing an excellent teaching portfolio is an excellent preemptive defense against negative teaching evaluations.

11. Be wary of joint appointments

Do not accept joint appointments unless you can be reasonably assured, via written expectations, that the faculty and administration in both departments will support you. Be wary of competing teaching and service assignments in different departments. There is no such thing as a fifty-fifty time commitment; joint appointments often add up to two 100 percent jobs.

12. Learn how to interview

Practice your formal presentation in front of trusted colleagues who will provide constructive feedback. Practice your research presentation, teaching/lecture, and question/answer session. Ask trusted colleagues to help you learn how to address questions from students, faculty, and administrators. When interviewing for administrative positions, practice with supporters in higher positions than those you want to obtain. Dress professionally and conservatively for all interviews. Promptly write concise thank-you letters or e-mails to persons who interviewed you.



### 13. Your department head is your main lifeline in the academy

Good department heads take their role with respect to faculty development very seriously. Candidly discuss expectations with your head/chair, especially relative to scholarly productivity, teaching, service, leaves of absence, office hours, and anything else that reflects upon or impacts your success. Let them know your goals. If you are interested in administration, ask your department head to nominate or appoint you to lead committees involved in important service to your department, college, or university. However, it is best to wait until after you have achieved tenure to volunteer for time-consuming service activities. Discuss problematic relationships with colleagues. The department head should be the first person to know if you are bullied or harassed in any way. If your head is the perpetrator of this oppression, immediately go to your dean; proceed up the hierarchy of supervisors if necessary. If you have difficulty relating to your department head, a mentor from outside your department may be particularly helpful in facilitating communications and guiding you. Meet with your dean and ask for the support you need, but remember that as the administrative chain of command rises, the responsibilities and number of faculty under the guidance of these people increases substantially. Be succinct with your concerns and requests and arrive at meetings with possible solutions.

## Networks of Allies and Mentors

### *Recommendations for Administrators*

1. Understand the different types of experiences and needs of members of United States underrepresented groups and foreign-born nationals on your campus

Although these groups may be lumped together as people of color, they typically have very different ideals, values, expectations, and needs (Ogbu, 1998). It is not the case that all groups identified within the United States as people of color support or understand one another. For instance, foreign nationals may need assistance with immigration issues. Have an office with expertise on these matters that can provide assistance and advice. Foreign nationals may not see themselves as people of color nor believe that others see them as people of color. They may not even know what it implies to be perceived as a member of a historically underrepresented group. Quite to the contrary, having come to the US from places where they were part of the majority group, they may reject an identity as people of color and/or as a minority. They may also share common prejudices against people of color born in the United States. Foreign nationals—especially those who were able to leave their countries for education in the United States—often come from upper-class backgrounds in their home countries. In contrast, members of domestic minority groups are over-represented in the lower socioeconomic ranks. These differences in social class may adversely impact relationships between foreign nationals and domestic faculty of color.

Finally, do not assume that the presence of several foreign-born people of color in an academic area precludes racism in that field. Some white people may be more likely to accept foreign-born nationals than native-born people of color. The difference reflects the domestic person of color's knowledge of the way racism functions within the United States, and the guilt and/or denial that some whites feel about

historical and current racism. The foreign-born and -raised typically do not know US racial history the way natives do. In addition, members of US historically under-represented groups often have reputations as activists and troublemakers who do not remain passive when their civil rights are violated. That makes them a threat to some people's perception of collegiality.

*Some Asian American women from low-income immigrant families financially support their parents and, at an early age, assumed adult responsibilities because their parents spoke limited English, and they continue to shoulder these burdens as graduate students and faculty . . . strong cultural expectations dictate that we must defer to and respect our elders. . . . Being nurturing and humble does not translate well into the competitive academic cultural environment, so adapting mandates some cultural retooling for many of us.*

Linda Trinh Võ, "Navigating the Academic Terrain: The Racial and Gender Politics of Elusive Belonging"

## 2. Address intersectionality

Race, class-based subordination, and gender and sexual identities do not act independently. Hostility against lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender (LGBT) people is still overtly and publically sanctioned. Because homosexuality is often associated with white men and women, they may dominate support groups for LGBT people, and these student support groups may not be accepting of people of color. As a result, queer, black, and female students, once admitted to the university, are often left to deal with campus hostilities on their own. All persons—especially university leaders—need to embrace this battle to respect persons across gender and sexual-identity boundaries. It is imperative that social-sciences and humanities courses address intersectionality.

*We have both a moral and a practical obligation to recognize—not deny—that other group-based markings—race, sexual orientation, class, and disability—are at work among women. It's both difficult and important that women who are white—the relatively privileged ones who have been the primary beneficiaries of feminism—perceive, acknowledge, and then act against the additional forms of discrimination experienced by women of color without feeling defensive.*

Nancy Cantor, "Introduction," Part III

## 3. Do not assume that people of color support other people of color

*Crab mentality*—the desire to bring down other people in your subordinated group who are getting ahead of you—affects some individuals. In addition, men of color—especially those from patriarchal backgrounds—may be disrespectful to women of color. Older faculty may be intimidated by or hostile toward younger faculty who manifest their identity differently or seem insufficiently deferential. Be aware that successful women of color may refute those who want to use race, sex, sexual identity, and social class and their intersectionalities as excuses for their lack of achievement, which arouses anger and resentment. Avoid using one senior

person of color as the gatekeeper or official spokesperson on race. You do not want someone in authority to subtly undermine the varied perspectives of others of color in your community. Consult with faculty from across ranks and disciplines. Do not let one person's attitudes—especially toward other people of color—devalue the contributions of their colleagues. Racial/ethnic groups have different experiences, shaped by their history in the United States. Those histories have implications for life today. You must ascertain the needs of each group. Do not assume that the expectations, needs, and values of one group of color speak for all.

*“A troubling pattern that plagues many educational institutions is the tendency of faculty and administrators to adopt a faculty member of color as the official pet or mascot. The pet may be a key administrator’s personal favorite, who serves as the official spokesperson for all faculty of color. She may be the ‘exceptional’ woman of color whose accomplishments (real or imagined) or compliant attitude put other faculty of color in a negative light. In public the pet makes a dramatic display of her selfless efforts to support colleagues of color. In private the pet is harshly critical of the teaching and scholarship of these same colleagues, thereby reinforcing the race- and gender-based presumption of incompetence.”*

Angela P. Harris and Carmen G. González,  
“Introduction”

4. Facilitate development of social networks to counter isolation and create circles of safety and camaraderie

Such networks increase faculty retention and facilitate interdisciplinary work, valued by most institutions and funding agencies. Additionally, when women of color cannot find support in their own departments, they will know other faculty to whom they can turn for support (Padilla and Chávez, 1993; see chapters in Turner and Myers 2000). You can facilitate networks by sponsoring breakfasts, lunches, or dinners that provide an opportunity for persons of color to gather and meet each other. Commit resources for community building.

*. . . I was fortunate to have the chance to participate in a support group for junior women of color faculty. We just gathered over delicious meals (you are compelled to learn how to make your favorite ethnic foods in these locations) and shared stories about overcoming isolation. We shared advice on campus policies, networking opportunities, and contending with the promotion process. . . . I have also been at institutions with white women presidents, one who sponsored informal gatherings at her residence for women faculty of color to network and to provide input on how to make the campus culture more supportive of their needs.*

Linda Trinh Võ, “Navigating the Academic Terrain:  
The Racial and Gender Politics of Elusive Belonging”

5. Establish leadership-development paths and opportunities

Women of color are frequently not groomed for management and administrative positions (Valverde 2003). To increase the pool of qualified women of color

candidates, especially for upper administrative positions, develop internal internships—such as special assistant to the president—which typically last one year. Create a meaningful, visible, significant task and appoint a woman of color to chair the committee. Appoint presidential commissions to resolve campus-wide issues and place women of color in charge of them. However, make sure that these appointments do not deal only with issues of race, ethnicity, sexual identity, and gender. If you assign women of color exclusively to positions involving these marginalized problems, you are guilty of stereotyping and tokenizing them and you may also be ensuring that their work is ghettoized. Nominate women of color for institutional leadership-development programs, such as the American Council on Education Fellows Program.

Pay particular attention to the mentoring needs of women of color in positions of power and authority. Remember that, because of racist and sexist biases held by persons from all groups, people will be especially resentful that these women are in powerful positions. It is also important not to keep department heads for long terms, e.g., more than eight to ten years. This longevity deprives women of color of the opportunity to develop key administrative leadership skills that prepare them for further advancement.

*Leadership roles can be treacherous for women of color since their authority is often challenged more than that of white males or females. . . . Asian American women still have to work against the prevalent stereotypes of them as submissive and subservient, which can undermine their authority and prevent them from being considered for leadership positions . . . . I am still taken aback by the level of incivility and disrespect female administrators experience, behavior that male colleagues would not direct at male administrators.*

Linda Trinh Võ, “Navigating the Academic Terrain: The Racial and Gender Politics of Elusive Belonging”

### *Recommendations for Women of Color and Allies*

1. Establish informal, grassroots organizations for men and women of color

These can be social- and/or task-oriented. Examples of task-oriented groups are ones that organize for collective meetings with the administration or reading groups that create safe places to provide and receive feedback. Social gatherings, such as potlucks at alternating homes, provide a connection with faculty across campus, as well as a feeling of family in the community. These networks facilitate collective action and maintain positive subgroup identity (Wright 1997; Wright, Taylor, and Moghaddam 1990). Developing informal and/or formal social networks facilitates a sense of belonging and hence encourages retention. Some of these groups may be focused on developing race consciousness and navigating discriminatory experiences and environments. Invite the president to some of your events. The presence of the president or other high-ranking administrators helps legitimize the importance of the group to the campus. Find solidarity; go to conferences and find allies as you listen to presentations. While these networks support your feelings of

belonging and safety, it is important also to seek out white colleagues and allies who can mentor you and whom you can learn to trust.

2. Seek out alliances with productive faculty across race/ethnicity, socioeconomic status, and gender and sexual identities

Productive faculty are less likely to be threatened by your successes than are those whose scholarship is stagnant. Form relationships with persons across disciplines whose research/creativity has commonalities with yours. These can lead to greater scholarly productivity and enhanced grant writing successes for you and them. These alliances reduce feelings of alienation and loneliness. They may also become persons whose feedback you learn to trust.

3. Take advantage of multiple identities

No one is free from realities associated with intersectionality. Intersections can place you at the margins, or they can situate you in a unique place to form bridges. If you are from a lower socioeconomic background, you can learn a great deal about the academic rules of the game from members with upper-class roots. The rules of academia were created for white, upper-class men. However, do not automatically stereotype white men and women as coming exclusively from the upper class.

5. Be proactive and cautious in choosing formal mentors, rather than relying on a first-come rotation of the department's available senior faculty

In general you will find that productive faculty members are the most welcoming because they are the least likely to be threatened by your success. However, you must be careful. The most alienated people—often out of desperation—are quick to recruit allies, some of whom may give them bad advice.

6. Build relationships and alliances with foreign nationals

Foreign nationals often lack knowledge of United States history and its racist foundation and ongoing racial struggles. You may need to educate them about past and present discrimination. Foreign nationals may also not identify as people of color or understand that some white people may lump them together with US racial minorities. They may not understand that other white people often prefer them to people of color born in the United States or the resentments that this discrimination may generate. Do not assume that all foreign nationals had upper-social-class upbringings. At the same time, however, after you have formed relationships with members of this group, you may discuss the topic of social class and learn what it means in their culture. You can help them understand how it functions in the United States. Bring foreign nationals into your reading or social group. The alliance will benefit them as well as the members of US historically underrepresented groups.

7. Form alliances with white men and women who value intersectionalities and acknowledge their white privilege

To be allies, white women must avoid the urge to lecture women of color on feminism or try to bond as sisters without acknowledging the significance and consequences of intersectionality. They must be fully cognizant that many women and men of color have different priorities, such as challenging racism, class-based

subordination, and/or homophobia. White women must take to heart the lesson of intersectionality: women of color face the challenge of overcoming not only the presumed incompetence of race, but due to racist and sexist stereotypes, that of their gender. Regarding white men, remember that they may know the rules of the game better than any other persons on campus. Supportive white men will co-opt the privileged status of their group by using their expertise to guide you through what would otherwise be a foreign cultural maze.

8. If you are interested in an administrative career, seek out and accept leadership-development opportunities by serving on committees and task forces and successfully chairing these groups

The more significant the task is for the campus community at large, the more visible will be your contributions. Let your upper-level administrators know if you are interested in administrative development. Do not, however, allow yourself to be appointed only to committees and task forces concerned exclusively with diversity. In addition, do not assume that this committee service takes precedence over excellent teaching and scholarly productivity when it comes to tenure, promotion, evaluation, and compensation consideration. If you want these development opportunities—which will give you administrative experience—be selective and understand that you have increased your workload. It is best to achieve tenure and the rank of full professor before adding service work that will not be considered for promotion. An added word of caution—when you serve in leadership positions, remember to pace yourself. Faculty are often resistant to change. Keep in mind that small wins matter, and enough small wins can change a culture over time.

9. The silence of reasonable and fair-minded members of the academy allows the unethical treatment of their colleagues to continue

Dr. Martin Luther King Jr. cautioned that we remember the silence of our friends more than the words of our enemies. In the case of academia, the silence of the supposed friends of those who are being unjustly treated is deafening. These persons who witness and/or are aware of miscarriages of justice often sacrifice their integrity to ensure their own success by accepting the status quo.

10. Do not adopt victim status and/or make an identity for yourself out of the pain you have experienced

Such status robs you of your positive identity and cheats your spirit. Remember that you are a survivor and a person who can thrive in any situation. As Eckhart Tolle (1999) and other spiritual writers have noted, the pain is part of you, but it is not you. Do not create drama; others will create enough without your adding to it. Accepting a situation does not mean that you like it or agree with it. You may need to find internal peace to remain healthy. To the extent you are subordinated in some way (race, class, gender, sexual identity), use that subordination as a means of empathizing with others, rather than simply favoring the group you come from. Recognize the similarities and differences in the various forms of subordination that we face. Do not rank the severity of oppressions. Try to foster an atmosphere of solidarity, mutual respect, and support with other subordinated groups. Be alert to efforts to divide and conquer.

### 11. Be conscious of other ways that we are privileged

These ways include race, sexuality, social class, mental and physical health, and nationality, among unlimited others. Use your privilege to benefit others. We are privileged to have our degrees and work in educational environments that can positively affect people's lives. One of the most important ways we are privileged is reflected in our circle of relationships and love. Nurture those relationships.

### 12. Understand that there is a price to pay for not remaining silent and for remaining silent

The first price may affect your career; the second may impact your spirit. Your academic self may be inconsistent with your authentic nature. As you determine how to respond to uncomfortable situations, keep your long-term goals in mind and let them inform your response. Find a way to hang onto your authentic self—through mentors, friends, family, and social networks. Understand what it means to maintain your integrity. You must know yourself and know your boundaries.

### *Final Words to Women of Color*

Nurture personal relationships with those who love you and listen when they express concern. Sometimes loved ones know better than we do what is best for us. Be aware that, when psychologically injured at work, you may experience the stages of grief identified by Elisabeth Kubler-Ross (1973)—denial, anger, bargaining, depression, and acceptance. Awareness and understanding of these stages facilitates your healing. Remember, also, that when you are in psychological pain you may not be able to focus on producing your best work. Receive support from a counselor or psychologist, especially when trusted friends are not physically accessible in your current location. Try not to take things personally. Try to maintain hope and faith that difficult situations will pass. Life goes on. Finally, remember to laugh. Be sure to take care of your body and your spirit. Enjoy the moments that make an academic's life worthwhile and gratifying. Remember that—even under the most challenging circumstance—ours is a noble and privileged profession; we can transform minds and lives. We can make a positive difference for someone every day.

*We have to learn how to deal with turmoil without getting changed by it. We have to remember why we are doing this work, develop a vision for ourselves . . . By deciding who we are in the face of the reality we are surrounded by and who we want to be, we take ourselves out of a reactive place and into a space that we have designed for ourselves. It is a space that is very much based in reality and focused, and a place where we are aware of those things around us we can choose to change. But it is also a space where we balance what we need with what we must do. . . . Success means helping our people, connecting to others, being real, and making things better for our families and communities. It is essential to find a way to integrate that definition into the work that we do—otherwise we do run the risk of losing ourselves in the work for reasons we do not fully understand.*

Beth A. Boyd, "Sharing Our Gifts"

